

NORTHUMBRIA POLICE



Death of Hilda Murrell

Independent Review

by

P. SMITH, Esq.
Assistant Chief Constable
Northumbria Police

Report



From : Assistant Chief Constable,
P. SMITH

FORCE HEADQUARTERS
PONTELAND
NEWCASTLE UPON TYNE
NE20 0BL

PONTELAND 72555

PS/MMJ

9th May 1985

Mr A A Mullett QPM
Chief Constable
West Mercia Constabulary
Constabulary Headquarters
Hindlip Hall
Hindlip
WORCESTER WR3 8SP

Dear Sir

DEATH OF MISS HILDA MURRELL

I respond to my appointment by your predecessor on 4 March 1985, to independently review the police enquiry and accompanying speculation concerning the death of the above named woman.

My review is now finalised and attached is a report and accompanying documentation with my findings. In addition to this, I have prepared a 24 minute video which projects a lot of the more contentious speculation advanced and briefly highlights the important features of the crime.

The video I suggest, will be useful to anyone who may have to present the review findings and it could be most suitably introduced between paragraphs 90 and 91 of the report.

It is to be hoped that the positive findings of my review help to reduce the intense speculation.

Can I take this opportunity on behalf of the review team of thanking you and your staff for making our stay in Shrewsbury as enjoyable as it possibly could have been under the circumstances.

Yours faithfully

Sir,

DEATH OF MISS HILDA MURRELL

1. On the 4th March 1985, Mr P SMITH, Assistant Chief Constable, Northumbria Police, was appointed by Mr R W COZENS QPM, the then Chief Constable of West Mercia, to independently review the Police enquiry into the death of Hilda MURRELL and also examine the credibility of the various theories and speculation advanced from all sources.

2. The review officer was given clear and concise terms of reference which required him to report his findings to the Chief Constable of West Mercia.

3. To assist him in the review Mr SMITH appointed Detective Superintendent C HALL from his own force. The remainder of the review team were from Northumbria, and all were supported by Mr Alfred FARAGHER, BSc, M.I.BIOL, a very experienced forensic scientist from the Home Office Laboratory at Wetherby.

4. His task was to carry out an independent review on all aspects of the forensic investigation and findings relating to the death of Miss MURRELL. In addition, he was asked to review the use of scientific and professional resources which had supported the enquiry. Mr FARAGHER was given clear and concise terms of reference requiring him to report his findings to Mr SMITH.

5. On the day of his appointment, Mr SMITH together with the Chief Constable of West Mercia, attended a Press Conference at which the review officer strongly emphasised that the appointment of himself and Mr FARAGHER in no way suggested a lack of confidence in the way enquiries had already been conducted.

Document 1.
Page No 1.

Document 1.
Page No 1.

Document 2.
Page No 2.

6. After establishing a complete overview of a lengthy Police enquiry and the various theories and speculation that surrounded the case, it soon became apparent that the review would best be conducted down two separate routes. The first was a close scrutiny of the circumstances relating to the criminal enquiry, whilst the latter would concentrate on evaluating the various theories and speculation that have grown into national news.

7. To give a clear account of the review this report will discuss three distinct aspects. The first deals with the circumstances surrounding her bizarre and controversial death and police action. This is followed by a review and evaluation of the various theories and intense speculation from all sources, particularly those relating to the involvement of British Intelligence, Sizewell Agents and the Police-State Conspiracy. The report is then concluded with an evaluation on all aspects of the enquiry accompanied by observations, criticism, advice and recommendations.

8. The following paragraphs present a concise overview of the circumstances surrounding the death of Miss MURRELL and the progress of the enquiry to date. Contentious aspects of Police action are identified and discussed in greater depth as the report goes on.

REVIEW - POLICE INVESTIGATION

9. At 10.40 a.m. on Saturday, 24th March 1984, the body of Miss Hilda MURRELL, 78 years, was found 6 miles from her home lying in a coppice at Hunkington, 500 yards from a minor road that runs between Haughmond Hill and Withington. The ground was wet due to heavy rainfall during the previous 24 hours. The Pathologist Dr P R ACLAND, DMJ (Path) MRG, is of the opinion that she

Photograph Nos
Nos 26-27

Document 3
Page No 6

Document 3
Page No 4

died the previous Wednesday 21st March, from Hypothermia having been physically assaulted and stabbed five times through her clothing in the region of the right abdomen, penetrating her liver. The weapon was a narrow bladed knife which has not been recovered.

Document 3
Page No 3

10. She had bruising to the face, abrasions to the hands, a broken right clavicle, deep defence wounds to the inside of both hands and a penetrating wound to the upper right arm. Both her knees were severely abraded showing a pink discolouration which could suggest that she had been crawling about. The Pathologist told an Inquest that death was most likely between 5 to 10 hours after being stabbed, suggesting that she died somewhere between 6 p.m. and 11 p.m. He thought that if she had received medical treatment immediately after the attack she would have lived.

Document 4
Page Nos 8-16
Photograph
Nos 1-4

11. The deceased was a frail old spinster, well educated, mentally alert and comparatively wealthy. She lived alone at 52 Sutton Road, Shrewsbury, a good class three bedroomed detached house standing in its own mature landscape gardens.

12. Miss MURRELL was born in Shrewsbury and educated at Newnham College, Cambridge where she read English, Modern and Medieval Languages and French. Her late parents ran the family firm of MURRELL's nurseries from which Hilda derived her life long passion for flowers and conservation. After graduating she joined the family firm later becoming an international authority on rose species, especially old varieties and miniatures. She was a well known conservationist which absorbed a lot of her spare time.

13. It is known that on the morning of the 21st March she left home and drove her car into the Abbey Foregate area of Shrewsbury about $\frac{1}{2}$ mile away. She withdrew £50 cash from the bank and bought some groceries and fruit. She returned home at about 12 noon and parked her car on the gravel driveway. She did not go indoors straight away but instead crossed the road to pay for some charity draw tickets. After returning to her house she either disturbed or allowed the offender(s) to enter.

Photograph No 1

14. It was later found that the dwelling had not been forcibly entered but access could have been gained through an insecure veranda door. It seems possible that a slight struggle took place upstairs as a freshly broken baluster rail was lying in three pieces, two on the Ottoman in the bathroom and the remaining one on the landing.

Photograph No 4

Photograph No 11

Photograph No 9

15. The downstairs telephone wires in the breakfast room had been wrenched from the junction box rendering the facility inoperative. The breakfast room curtains were drawn but the lights had been left on. The house showed signs of a search which was fairly systematic and tidy suggesting that the offender was looking for money or easily transportable items of value. Although purses and handbags were gone through, nothing is known to have been stolen.

Photograph Nos
8,12,13

Photograph No 15

16. It can be assumed that Miss MURRELL was then driven by an adult male in her own white Renault saloon LNT 917W to Hunkington Lane, an area surrounded only by open arable land, where the vehicle came to rest about 500 yards from where her body was ultimately found.

Photograph No 16

17. There were clear signs that the car had collided with both sides of the bank verge causing superficial damage. An unsuccessful attempt had been made to drive the vehicle out of the ditch. Stab type cuts were found on the near side dash board and to a pomelo in the vehicle. The only blood found was a small area on the outside of the rear door.

Statement File
Page Nos 1-2

18. It is certain this journey was made between 12.50 p.m. and 1 p.m. as no fewer than 12 witnesses saw the vehicle being driven erratically by a white adult male at various locations between her home and the point where it was found abandoned by a local farmer John Wilfred MARSH. Eight of the witnesses say that Miss MURRELL was sitting in a slumped position in the front passenger seat. The driver was described as being between 25 - 40 years, average to thick set build, brown collar length hair, neatly cut with a fringe. He was clean shaven and wearing an anorak with a metal tag attached to the back.

Statement File
Page No 1
Photograph No 15

19. Mr MARSH the farmer, found the vehicle between 2.00 p.m. and 2.30 p.m. the same day but did not report the matter to the Police until 5.20 p.m. In all probability she was still alive at this time and could have been lying 500 yards away. Her body was not discovered until 10.40 a.m. the following Saturday morning, and this delay, which is a matter of some controversy, is subject to wider comment in paragraphs 34 to 55.

Document 3
Page No 3
Statement File
Page Nos 3-9

Document 4
Page Nos 17-20
Photograph Nos
26-27

20. Dr ACLAND, Pathologist and Mr M R WEBSTER BA. Forensic Biologist, visited the scene and saw the body of Hilda MURRELL lying in a coppice. She was wearing a brown woollen coat, two jumpers, an underslip bearing traces of semen and one stocking on the left foot. The other stocking was found nearby. At different locations within a distance

Document 4
Page No 19
Photograph Nos
18-24

of 450 yards from the body were her skirt, suspender belt, moccasin type boots which were 30' apart, broken spectacles, wide rimmed brown hat and a kitchen knife from her home. Her car keys were found in the coat she was wearing. Her Driving Licence and MOT certificate were found some distance away on Hunkington Lane, together with her AA wallet which had also been stabbed several times.

21. It is pertinent to mention that there was no cash found either on the body or in the house and enquiries suggest that after shopping she should still have had about £47 left. She was not in the habit of keeping cash at home.

Statement File
Page Nos 10-14
Photograph No 12

22. During a forensic examination by the Scientist Mr K G BARNETT at the house, a pair of her knickers were found in an upstairs bedroom, as was a handkerchief which bore traces of semen. Unfortunately, grouping tests on both finds of semen were unsuccessful and found to be free of spermatozoa, suggesting that the person shedding them was either naturally aspermic or had undergone a vasectomy.

Statement File
Page Nos 60 & 67
Statement File
Page No 59

23. A can of lager had been taken from a cupboard downstairs, partly consumed and deposited in the upstairs toilet basin. Human excreta was found on the inside rim at the rear of the downstairs toilet pan.

Photograph No 14
Statement File
Page No 63

24. A recurring shoe print which has not been eliminated, was found in the breakfast room. Enquiries reveal that the shoe was of a trainer type, Rumanian make with no brand name, which had been imported solely for Wakefields Stores. It has only been possible to trace those purchasers who used a bankers or credit card and they have all been eliminated. Cash customers provide an obstacle to the completion of this enquiry.

25. A forefinger impression of the left hand was found on the inside rear off-side window of the deceased's vehicle. This mark still remains outstanding after a most exhaustive search eliminating 1200 suspects to date. To expedite this line of enquiry, two West Mercia officers and two from MID-CRO were attached to the National Identification Bureau for two weeks whilst 30,000 records were unsuccessfully searched.

Document 5
Page Nos 21-23

26. An inquest into her death was held on 5th December 1984, when HM Coroner Colonel David CRAWFORD-CLARKE, in the absence of a jury, returned a verdict that Miss MURRELL died at Hunkington probably on 21st March 1984, and that the cause of death was (a) Hypothermia, the victim suffering from (b) penetrating wounds to the abdomen and (c) multiple bruises to her face.

27. Two local men have admitted stealing a vehicle Excise Licence from Miss MURRELL's car on the afternoon it was abandoned, but they could not be connected with her death.

28. The long running murder enquiry and the growing number of speculative theories to find a motive have consumed huge manpower resources. Involvement has fluctuated from 112 officers in the earlier stages down to the present commitment of 31. No fewer than 660 suspects have been traced and interviewed.

29. The following statistics give some indication of the administration involved and also help to portray the vast volume of work this enquiry has so far demanded.

<u>Cumulative Totals</u>		<u>Index Cards</u>	
Statements	2561	Nominal	22360
Reports	177	Street	2855
Actions	5173	Telephone	1170
Messages	1718	Vehicle	8165
Telexes	363	Subject	6050
House to House	12251	Other Indexes	3120
Questionnaires	2706		
Other documents	730		

30. To date, still hunting the offender, we are left with the following eliminating factors which are unweighted.

- (a) Time of offence - between 12 noon and 2.30 p.m. Wednesday, 21st March, 1984.
- (b) Sole Pattern - Training shoe (Rumanian make)
- (c) Fingerprint impression - inside of car
- (d) A natural aspermic or person having had vasectomy
- (e) Narrow bladed knife
- (f) Smokes Hamlet cigars
- (g) Drinks alcohol

31. The enquiry team has been supported by members of the No 4 Regional Crime Squad and the Forensic and Scientific activity has been immense. Hypnosis has been tried and advice sought from the FBI in an effort to establish a crime profile of the offender(s).

32. Press and media interest has taken off since an article about the murder appeared in the New Statesman magazine last November. The reasons for this are later explained in much more detail. Harlech Television have already screened two documentaries and are considering a third. ITV have shown a similar production screened on a 'World in Action' programme whilst the televising of 'Crime Watch UK' has renewed public interest.

33. In addition a two minute video film was screened in a local cinema in January dealing with the background of the case and appealing for continued assistance from the Community. These all relate to her death and the tangled web of speculative theory that continues to grow more than a year later.

EVENTS LEADING UP TO DISCOVERY OF BODY

34. It seems pertinent at this stage to look closely at the events leading up to the discovery of the body. This without doubt, is a sore point which has been vociferously expressed by a lot of people who are most reluctant to believe the Police version. These include numerous local residents, the media and more forcibly the deceased's close family and friends who refuse to accept and cannot appreciate why it took the Police three days to take seriously her absence once the car had been found.

35. It seems that this area of public concern forms the roots from which much of the speculation grew, causing many people to suspect that her death was anything but a burglary gone wrong. The following paragraphs will hopefully put this issue into an understandable and acceptable version of fact.

36. Dealing with fact, Miss MURRELL's car was first seen abandoned in Hunkington Lane between 2 p.m./2.30 p.m. on Wednesday, 21st March 1984, by John Wilfred MARSH, a local farmer, who later notified Constable 1596 C P DAVIES at home and off duty. He commenced work at 6 p.m. and together with Constable 1025 R E EADES, visited the scene in daylight. They found superficial damage to the abandoned car.

Document 4
Page No 18
Statement File
Page No 1
Statement File
Page Nos 15-16
Statement File
Page Nos 27-30

37. The officers viewed the immediate vicinity and formed the opinion from the position of tyre marks in the lane, that the car had collided with both sides of the banked verges, skidded on the left hand bend before swerving across the road and coming to rest in a ditch. An unsuccessful attempt had obviously been made to move the vehicle. A Hamlet cigar wrapper was found inside the car together with a small tent peg, which appeared to have been adapted to make a poacher's snare.

Statement File
Page No 19

38. An immediate PNC check showed Miss MURRELL as the owner and that the vehicle was not reported stolen.

Statement File
Page No 17

39. They saw nothing obvious at this stage to suggest that anyone had been injured. The ignition keys had been removed and the position of the car offered no apparent danger or obstruction. They left the scene following a preliminary search in dry conditions of adjoining hedgerows and visually scanning the fields and coppice. Whether this search was sufficient in the circumstances has been a bone of contention to many of the deceased's close friends and family. Constable DAVIES chose not to update Mr MARSH at that time or pursue the matter further. He was on duty Thursday the following day, but did not follow up enquiries.

Statement File
Page No 19

40. About Friday teatime, Mr MARSH noticed that the Renault car was still there and informed the Police. Constable DAVIES was told when reporting for duty at 6 p.m. He was also informed that efforts to contact the keeper by telephone had failed. He then tried on several occasions and although he received a ringing tone no-one answered.

Statement File
Page No 2
Document 7
Page Nos 26-27
Statement File
No 19

41. Constable DAVIES then went to her home arriving in darkness at 7 p.m. He noticed a light on in the breakfast room downstairs and that the curtains were closed.

Statement File
Page No 20
Document 4
Page No 11
Photograph Nos
7-8

Photograph Nos 1,
6 & 8

The adjacent side door facing Sutton Road was wide open. No one responded so he entered the house through the open door and walked into the unlit kitchen leading to the breakfast room. The breakfast room doorway was open but he decided not to enter although he clearly recollects that some papers and an open brown handbag were lying on the table. This observation tends to suggest that he went further with his examination than he is now prepared to say. Believing that the wind might have blown open the side door he left the house, closing it behind him.

Document 7
Page No 26

42. If the contents of the previous paragraph are a true account, it was unfortunate that once inside he did not choose to examine any other part of the house because he would have then seen signs of a disturbance and the presence of unread newspapers and unopened mail. After updating Headquarters at Shrewsbury of a negative visit and asking that further efforts be made to contact Miss MURRELL, he then continued normal duty. Several unsuccessful efforts were then made from the Police Station to make contact.

Statement File
Page Nos 35-37

Photograph No 1

Document 7
Page No 27
Document 4
Page Nos 9-15

43. At 7 a.m. on the following morning, Saturday 24th March, Constable 1441 E LANE visited the home of the deceased and found the side door insecure. He got no response and continued normal duty. However, 75 minutes later he returned, in daylight but again found no one in. He entered the house by the side door, went upstairs to the attic before returning to the ground floor. He then looked in all downstairs rooms where he saw the odd drawer and cupboard door open, that the breakfast room light was still on and the curtains drawn. He too noticed the papers and the open handbag on the table. Inside the front door was a collection of post and two Guardian newspapers for the previous days. What he saw concerned him and he left by the side door securing it behind him.

44. His suspicions for the safety of Miss MURRELL were now fully aroused and he immediately reported them to supervision at Shrewsbury Police Station, forcibly suggesting that the Hunkington Lane area where the car was abandoned should be thoroughly searched.

Document 7
Page No 27
Statement File
Page Nos 37-38

45. At 10.15 a.m. the same day Constable EADES and a local gamekeeper's wife, with two gun dogs, searched the area and found the body of Miss MURRELL in the coppice. The following paragraphs give an account of the action taken by the Police from being notified about the car to finding her body. Perhaps it is now appropriate, because of the volume of criticism, to assess the judgement which promulgated this course of action.

Statement File
Page No 33
Photograph Nos
26-27
Document 7
Page No 18

46. It is acceptable for reasons given, that the first two officers attending the abandoned car attached no great importance to their findings. In support of this, and to answer criticism, press release dated 9th January 1985, quoted statistics showing that in the first quarter of 1984 250 vehicles were abandoned in the rural areas of Shrewsbury. Five of these had been stolen. Additionally in excess of 1,000 were abandoned during the whole of last year for various reasons ranging from drivers visiting beauty spots, simple mechanical breakdowns and minor accidents etc. The majority of these vehicles were recovered by their owners within 48 hours. This information given to the media was not quite accurate but would have been so if the word 'abandoned' had been explained to make it clear that it included vehicles which were checked whilst temporarily left unattended by their owners as well as vehicles which were abandoned.

Document 8
Page No 31
Document 9
Page No 40

Document 5
Page No 21

47. Accepting the opinion of the Pathologist Dr ACLAND, that Miss MURRELL was likely to have died sometime between 5 - 10 hours after being stabbed, then there has to be a strong likelihood that she was alive and not too far away when the officers first visited Hunkington Lane to examine the Renault.

Statement File
Page Nos 16,28

Photograph No
15,17

48. From the position of the vehicle and the circumstances under which it had been abandoned, Constable DAVIES cannot be criticized for treating the incident as just another case of an unattended or abandoned vehicle. Considering this, any request by him at that stage for a thorough search of the area would not have been compatible with the best use of limited Police resources. It is also doubtful whether such a suggestion would have prompted a decision by supervision to do so.

Document 7
Page No 26
Statement File
Page No 2
Statement File
Page No 20

49. However, accepting that his judgement was sound up to this point, the officer and more importantly his supervision, must surely then be criticized for failing to ensure that every effort was made to locate Miss MURRELL. It is sad that there is no record of any positive action being taken on the Thursday and that it took a further call on Friday teatime, again from Mr MARSH, to seemingly resurrect the enquiry. Constable DAVIES then went to the home of the deceased at 7 p.m. that evening and found no-one in. He then took action in accordance with paragraph 41.

50. Considering the information already at hand, his decision following the visit to do no more than ask Headquarters to make further telephone contact, hopefully, does not project the norm for initiative of an officer with five years police service.

Statement File
Page No 26
Document 7
Page No 26

51. Mr SMITH feels that he should at least have pursued more local enquiries and is at a loss to understand why he did not, and more importantly, why his supervision failed to sense that things were not right. There is no dispute that Constable DAVIES updated his control at 7.20 p.m. on the Friday evening and should have done more, but even so, supervision should by then have grasped the nettle. The finding of the car belonging to a missing elderly woman who had not been seen for two days and whose home was insecure and vulnerable, should have prompted some positive action.

Statement File
Page No 36

Document 4
Page Nos 10-13
Photograph No 1
Document No 7
Page No 27

52. The criticism levelled against Constable DAVIES is to a great extent supported by the alert actions of Constable LANE. He, with 11 years service, pursued the enquiry on the Saturday morning and went in daylight to the home of the deceased at 8.15 a.m. following an unsuccessful visit earlier in the shift. He entered the house by the open side door and after visiting all rooms his suspicions were soon aroused. He wasted no time in contacting Shrewsbury Police Station suggesting that a dog handler should search the area around the abandoned Renault. It was his positive action which led to the finding of the body.

Statement File
Page Nos 36 & 37
23 & 24

Document 4
Page No 11

53. Fortunately Constable LANE took the initiative and searched the house. He showed perception to suspect that something was wrong. Constable DAVIES claims that on the Friday evening he went no further than the kitchen having taken the initiative and entered the house. Considering the knowledge he had it is then questionable why he did not continue to try and find Miss MURRELL. The only difference in the circumstances between his visit and that of Constable LANE is that when the latter visited the house, it was daylight.

54. However much the actions of Constable DAVIES are reviewed, it would not be proper to let his immediate supervision escape without severe criticism for failing to instruct him along a course of action he was incapable of seeing for himself.

55. To conclude, a lack of proper supervision and direction was responsible for the body being discovered much later than it should have been. It could be forcibly argued that it delayed the commencement of a murder enquiry for possibly two days, a period which the Police Service would accept from long experience as being the most crucial 48 hours in any Homicide enquiry. However, it is not to be forgotten that comments like this are made with the wonderful wisdom of hindsight.

IAN COLIN GWILLUM SCOTT - ABSENCE OF BODY

Statement File
Page Nos 42 & 43

56. The evidence of witness Ian Colin Gwillum SCOTT has been the subject of contention from the very start of the investigation and has without doubt added even further speculation to the enquiry. To evaluate this he was further interviewed by the review officers about his controversial visit to 'The Moat' at 3.30 p.m. on Thursday, 22nd March 1984, claiming that there was no sign of a body at that time.

Statement File
Page No 43
Photograph No 27

57. He reiterated that the reason for visiting 'The Moat' was to count the Poplar trees with a view to felling. He accepted the suggestion as being quite feasible that it would be a natural tendency for anyone counting trees to look upwards rather than down and agreed that this theory could not be precluded as a supporting reason as to why he did not see the body. He concluded by saying that he was as sure as he possibly could be about the absence of the body but could never be absolutely certain. It is pertinent to mention that the body lay in a slight hollow dressed in clothing which matched the undergrowth.

Photograph No 26

58. From Pathological evidence Hilda MURRELL must have been dead when Mr SCOTT visited 'The Moat'. Accepting this, the only conceivable theory in support of his claim is that she died elsewhere and her body was quickly moved into the coppice after he left.

Document 3
Page No 3

59. Dr ACLAND suggests that the finding of two different areas of hypostasis provide classical evidence of Post Mortem movement of a body. However, his findings in this case established only one which strongly suggested that the body of the deceased woman had only laid in the position which she died. It is accepted that one cannot totally rule out movement of the body if it was quickly replaced as it had originally lain, but this is not even a consideration as it was over 24 hours later when Mr SCOTT visited 'The Moat'.

CONCLUSIONS

60. Mr SCOTT is intelligent and extremely alert for a man of 78 years. He is as sure as he can be that the body of Hilda MURRELL was not in the coppice when he visited 'The Moat' but admits he cannot be certain. Because of this Mr SMITH leans towards the overriding weight of Pathological evidence when assuming that the body lay in the coppice when Mr SCOTT arrived that day.

61. It is now appropriate to independently review and evaluate the various and intense speculation advanced from many sources as to the motive for killing Hilda MURRELL. The speculation concerning the inoperative telephone at 52 Sutton Road falls into this category.

DISCONNECTED TELEPHONE - 52 SUTTON ROAD

62. One contentious and speculative area of the enquiry concerns the Police account of the disconnected telephone

at the home of the deceased. The following paragraphs relate to facts which dispel the inaccurate speculation.

Document 10
Page No 43

63. On Thursday, 20th December 1984, Mr DALYELL said in the House of Commons 'the Police version of a burglar breaking in and being surprised did not tally with what was obviously a sophisticated break-in where a telephone had been cut leaving it so callers could ring in but not out'. This theory is shared by others.

64. One person who has questioned the Police account is a member of the West Mercia Police Authority, Councillor Derek WOODVINE. He appeared on a HTV documentary screened on the 7th February, 1985 and told viewers that on the 9th January this year, following a murder related press conference by the then Chief Constable of West Mercia Constabulary, he had been approached by a fellow councillor who claimed to have information tending to dispute Mr COZENS account of an unprofessional telephone disconnection at 52 Sutton Road.

Photograph No 9

65. Councillor WOODVINE, in his own terms described how he had a clandestine meeting with a British Telecom employee whose identity is unknown, who told him that a workmate who actually carried out the examination at 52 Sutton Road, had gone back into the depot and quite openly said that it had been disconnected by someone who obviously had some technical knowledge. In addition he had claimed that only the green wire had been disconnected from the junction box to give the effect to anyone ringing in that the line was working. Councillor WOODVINE said that it was this discrepancy, following all of the speculation and rumour in the quality newspapers, that first prompted him to become involved.

Photograph No 9

66. In pursuance of this, Councillor WOODVINE was seen at his home at Shrewsbury by Mr SMITH and Detective Superintendent HALL, where the details arising from his TV interview were discussed at greater length. The officers made him fully aware of the facts surrounding the disconnection in the hope of dispelling further rumour and speculation. He could not assist the officers further, but did forcibly remark that he was most concerned about the reaction from the West Mercia Police to criticism, describing it as being paranoid.

Statement File
Page Nos 44-54

Photograph No 9

67. Brian GEORGE, a neighbour of the deceased woman, gardened for her part time. He appeared on the 'World in Action' television documentary screened on the 4th March. He told viewers that he had visited Hilda MURRELL's home on the same morning as her body was discovered and noticed that the telephone cable in the breakfast room had been completely disconnected from the junction box. He also saw that the spade terminals on the end of each of the four wires were all intact and undamaged. In his view the disconnection had the hallmark of professionalism.

68. Mr SMITH and Detective Superintendent HALL saw Mr GEORGE at his Shrewsbury home where they discussed the matter further. To remove rumour and speculation he was presented with the facts surrounding the breakfast room telephone disconnection. He remained unmoved on his opinion of the sophisticated disconnection and dismissed out of hand the speculation circulating on the green wire theory.

69. On the subject of a motive for the murder he hedged his bets on all of the theories excluding the burglary gone wrong. He could not support any of his speculation. He did say that a few days prior to seeing the officers he had visited Mr DALYELL at the House of Commons to discuss the Hilda MURRELL case.

70. The following paragraphs give a factual account of the telephone disconnection at the home of the deceased.

Statement File
Page Nos 55-67

Document No 4
Page No 11
Statement File
Page No 57

Photograph No 9

71. At 4 p.m. on Saturday, 24th March 1984, Detective Sergeant H D PERRITON of the West Mercia Police Scientific Aids Department paid a visit to the home of the deceased at 52 Sutton Road to examine the house. Whilst making observations he noticed in the corner of the breakfast room that the wires leading from the telephone to a junction box fixed to the window sill, had been disconnected. He commenced a detailed examination of this which led him to conclude that the disconnection was anything but the work of a professional.

Statement File
Page Nos 68-74

Photograph No 9

72. Two days later Christopher Ronald MILEHAM, an engineer, visited the same house to examine the telephone damage. He too saw that the cord of the breakfast room telephone was completely disconnected from the junction box. The top of the box was missing having been previously removed for scientific examination by Detective Sergeant PERRITON. This extension was totally inoperative.

Statement File ,
Page No 69

Photograph No 9

73. He inspected the internal wiring system and noticed that the four screws which connected each wire to the junction box were all loose, and thought that they may have been unscrewed as opposed to being loosened by the cord being wrenched away. The four spade terminals were undamaged.

Statement File
Page No 69

74. The only other house extension in the bedroom was examined and it was established that the 'phone worked when making out-going calls but that anyone 'phoning in would only get the normal ringing tone and there would be no audible indication in the room because the bell mechanism circuit for the whole of the system had been disconnected downstairs.

75. Mr MILEHAM having had chance to review the whole of the circumstances later saw Councillor WOODVINE on TV expounding his speculation about the green wire theory. After clarifying certain aspects he was most emphatic that all four wires of the live telephone cord were disconnected and not just the green one as was suggested by the Councillor.

Statement File
Page No 73

76. The telephone engineer does not now favour the theory of an elaborate disconnection by someone familiar with telephone systems. Commenting on Mr WOODVINE's green wire theory, he said that the outcome of such singular disconnection would have kept the whole system in order at the exclusion of incoming calls which would not have activated the audible sound and could only have been received if the handset had been simultaneously lifted.

Statement File
Page No 72

77. Having seen Councillor WOODVINE on television Mr MILEHAM is certain they have never met which destroys any speculation that he was the Telecom source.

Document 10
Page No 43

78. Mr DALYELL's quote to members of the House supporting the sophisticated break-in theory shows inaccuracies. The first is his claim that the telephone wires had been cut as was his statement that once severed, the callers could be heard ringing in but no one could ring out. As regards the breakfast room telephone, this would be totally inoperative but outside calls could be dialled from the bedroom.

79. The information received by Councillor WOODVINE about the green wire theory being the only terminal disconnected, can only be weighed for validity against the evidence provided by the witnesses MILEHAM, Detective Sergeant PERRITON and Mr GEORGE. To evaluate each we

must take a close look at the evidence of Detective Sergeant PERRITON who was the first Police Officer to scientifically examine the home of the deceased.

Photograph No 9

80. He is in no doubt that when examining the breakfast room telephone, the junction box head, which was secured by a screw, was still in position and was covered with a very fine layer of dust. Curtains were hanging over the junction box obscuring it from internal view and it is felt that if moved or drawn apart, this would have had a wiping action disturbing the surface dust.

Photograph No 8

Photograph No 9

81. The officer then unscrewed the box lid to remove it and only half a turn was necessary. He noticed there were no new marks in the metal to indicate recent removal. He established that another cable not in use, which had been part of the original installation, had obviously been wound around, folded over and tucked into the junction box.

82. The live cable was made up of four inner wires each fitted with an open ended spade connector. These two cables, old and live, had been stapled side by side onto adjacent woodwork and were both in a convenient position to have been ripped out together in one aggressive action.

CONCLUSION

Photograph No 9

83. It would seem that the most obvious way to quickly disconnect the breakfast room telephone from inside, would be to wrench the two cables away from the junction box severing any connection the operative line may have had. Both were hung close together and could be grasped and pulled out with one hand. This sort of treatment would force away the staples supporting the cables to the window surrounds, which is what happened.

84. Such force would have applied pressure to the grommet surrounding the operative cable on its entry to the junction box. In support of this a broken piece from the entry aperture to the box was found on the window seat below. This type of force could well be expected to pull the spade terminals from under the screws without damaging them as was the case. This would leave the four holding screws loose which is what happened giving rise to speculation that they had been manually turned.

85. Considering the speculation about the breakfast room telephone against the firm evidence offered by Mr MILEHAM and Detective Sergeant PERRITON, Mr SMITH feels that the system was rendered inoperative by a spontaneous act of wrenching by hand, with both cables coming away from the junction box together.

Statement File
Page No 49

86. To accept the theory of Mr GEORGE that the wires were disconnected in a sophisticated manner, one would have to accept it would be impossible to wrench a live cable away without damaging any of the four spades. In consideration of this the review officers experimented with identical equipment and proved his theory wrong.

Photograph Nos
8 & 9

87. If Councillor WOODVINE's green wire theory was accepted, the conflicting corroborated evidence of Mr GEORGE, Mr MILEHAM and Detective Sergeant PERRITON would have to be ignored and dismissed out of hand. There seems no reason to doubt that the account given by these three witnesses is as they saw it on the day. This evidence is supported by photographs of the installation taken by Detective Sergeant PERRITON.

88. If the theory of a well trained Government Intelligence officer is considered, then the cutting of telephone wires is the most usual method adopted by professionals in pre-conceived situations.

89. After examining the green wire theory of Councillor WOODVINE and the speculative view of a professional disconnection held by Mr GEORGE, the review officer discounts them both and has given in the foregoing paragraphs, sound reasons for doing so.

90. The following paragraphs give a resume of how the speculation began and grew, to make Hilda MURRELL's death, one of the most controversial murders in Britain today.

SPECULATION - THE BELGRANO CONNECTION

91. During the early hours of 20th December 1984, Mr Tam DALYELL, Labour MP for Linlithgow alleged at a late sitting of the House of Commons, that during the third week in November 1984 he had received confidential information from a proven source that Miss Hilda MURRELL had been killed after disturbing members of the British Intelligence Service searching her Shrewsbury home. He said that there was no initial intent to kill her but things went disastrously wrong which had prompted a cover up between the Police and British Intelligence Services.

92. Mr DALYELL claimed that the search was for Belgrano related documents leaked over the sinking of the cruiser during the 1982 Falklands Conflict which cost the lives of 368 military conscripts. He put a lot of emphasis on Miss MURRELL being the aunt of Robert Denton GREEN, a former Naval Commander who held a responsible position in Intelligence during the Falklands Campaign.

Document 10
Page Nos 44 & 45

Document 11
Page No 50

Statement File
Page Nos 75-92
Document 10
Page No 42

Document 10
Page No 45

However, Mr DALYELL wrongly claimed that GREEN was the person who physically passed the signal for HMS Conqueror to sink the cruiser.

Document 10
Page No 43

93. He posed several questions on the subject criticising the way West Mercia Police had handled certain aspects of the enquiry and to use his own suggestive words, "that they had been told on high authority to act in such an uncharacteristically, incompetent and slapdash way to hide the facts."

Document 12
Page No 52

94. Mr DALYELL also informed the House that in the second week of November 1984, he had received an anonymous telephone call urging him to read carefully a two page article in the November issue of the New Statesman entitled 'The Death of Miss MURRELL'. This was written by journalist Judith COOK and seemed to be the forerunner to all the speculation advanced.

Document 10
Page No 42
Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

95. The article and Miss MURRELL/GREEN relationship seemed to provide Mr DALYELL with a real explanation for the murder. He has tirelessly campaigned to prove that the Belgrano was sunk whilst returning to port in a deliberate move to prevent any prospect of peace negotiations. He placed particular importance on Commander GREEN's background as concerns the Falklands War, and said that their circumstances placed him under suspicion with Intelligence Officers who were frantically searching for Belgrano related documents he may have left with his Aunt. This view was then generated by the media.

Document 13
Page Nos 62-63
Document 14
Page Nos 64-67

Document 15
Page No 68

96. These startling allegations in the House led to a promise by the Minister of State, Mr Giles SHAW, of a full reply to the revelations. Later, Mr DALYELL was not impressed when being unreservedly assured that his allegations about the involvement of the Intelligence Service were totally without foundation.

Document 16
Page Nos 69-81

Document 13
Page Nos 62-63
Document 14
Page Nos 64-67
Document 17
Page Nos 82-88

97. In response to these revelations, Mr DALYELL was interviewed by the Assistant Chief Constable of West Mercia Police, Mr B DREW, MBA, FBIM, who with Detective Chief Superintendent D COLE, QPM, saw him on the 15th January 1985, at the House of Commons. He reiterated his earlier allegations which to this day he continues to rigorously pursue in the House and through the media. He handed the officers a number of documents which included a letter to the Chief Constable of West Mercia Police. He refused to identify the source of his information, but promised to encourage his informant to speak to the Police once the Clive PONTING secrets trial was finished. Nothing has materialised since PONTING's acquittal and the MP made it quite clear that he was not the source.

Document 18
Page No 89

98. Mr COZENS replied to Mr DALYELL's letter on the 24th January, and told the MP that all of the speculation that he had expounded upon to Mr DREW had been carefully assessed, but had produced no evidence to lend substance to the claim of a link between the death of Miss MURRELL and British Intelligence.

Document 12
Page Nos 51-61

99. Following his appointment by the Chief Constable of West Mercia, to independently review the case, Mr P SMITH, Assistant Chief Constable, Northumbria Police, interviewed Mr DALYELL in Newcastle upon Tyne, on Monday 18th March 1985. with Detective Superintendent C HALL.

Document 12
Page No 60

100. A lengthy interview followed with Mr DALYELL merely reiterating the version given to Mr DREW and expounding on the intimate details of the Belgrano affair. He again refused to identify his source and did not enlarge on the information. He promised to contact his source and hopefully persuade him to meet Mr SMITH, but nothing materialised.

Document 19
Page Nos 90-91
Document 20
Page Nos 92-93

He later wrote to Mr SMITH thanking him for his courtesy and in further correspondence of the 4th April, implied that he had kept his promise and that it was now up to his source to decide any future move. No contact has been received from any source.

101. Mr DALYELL continues to pursue this avenue and openly remarks that there are persons in Westminster and/or Whitehall who know a great deal more about the death of Miss MURRELL than they have so far been prepared to divulge.

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

102. To evaluate DALYELL's theory, Mr SMITH and Detective Superintendent HALL travelled to Cornwall where on the 20th March 1985, they interviewed Judith COOK at her Newlyn home. She is a freelance journalist who had to be interviewed about the vast amount of speculation written in her 'New Statesman' article 'Death of a Rose Grower'. She agreed that the article contained several inaccuracies but did not offer any further information to support theories about the Belgrano leaks, Sizewell 'B' or any other speculation the article offered.

103. The possibility that Miss MURRELL's death might be connected with her anti-nuclear views was first mentioned in this publication. She explained that the material for the article had been wholly obtained from police sources, friends and relatives known to be close to the deceased, and in particular Mrs Joan TATE who the Review officers later interviewed.

104. It is of interest to discuss some of the inaccuracies in the article including certain statements she wrongly claims were made by the West Mercia Police. A resume of these follow:

Document 6
Page No 24

1. Paragraph (1)

Wrongly claims the Police told the Press that the house of the deceased had been ransacked.

Document 6
Page No 24

2. Paragraph (5)

Wrongly claims the Police told Commander GREEN that his aunt's body was found much later than the proper time and ultimately informed him that it was 7 a.m. on the Saturday.

Document 6
Page No 24

3. Paragraph (7)

Wrongly claims that

- a) The Police found out the car belonged to the deceased on Friday evening when it was Wednesday and
- b) That they forced entry into the house at 6 a.m. Saturday morning.

Document 6
Page No 24

4. Paragraph (8)

Wrongly claims that the Police agreed that the telephone disconnection was sophisticated.

Document 6
Page No 24

5. Paragraph (10)

Wrongly claims that Detective Chief Superintendent COLE was number 2 on the Lesley WHITTLE case, when he was never involved.

105. When Judith COOK was asked for an explanation for these mistakes, she claimed that all of the issues raised had been as a result of a telephone call to Detective Chief Inspector C FURBUR at the Murder Incident Room on the 22nd October, requesting information about the death of Hilda MURRELL. Her queries were answered the same day through the Force Press Office. The document relating

Document 21
Page Nos 94 & 95

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

to this communication gives an accurate account of what information was requested and supplied. It also leaves no doubt that Judith COOK was prepared to go to extreme lengths for a fascinating story, caring little about the reputation of West Mercia Police.

106. In addition to points already highlighted in Paragraph 104, the article wrongly quoted several dates together with other inaccuracies which are not worthy of further comment, because they in no way effect or concern the Police Service.

Document 6
Page No 25

107. However, it seems appropriate to quote just one of these which is contained in Paragraph 14. Namely, 'the body was returned in a zinc lined coffin in August. Police advised her family not to look inside. They complied and it was duly cremated.' Commander GREEN has no knowledge of this and as far as he is concerned it is a complete fabrication. His sister, Mrs Stella CHICK, later referred to, confirmed this.

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

108. So many inaccuracies suggest that the writer failed to check the facts and had obviously relied greatly on previous press coverage and what she had been told by persons close to the deceased.

109. Whilst being interviewed, Judith COOK complained that during early February 1985, over a two week period, mail coming from London started arriving at her home having been clumsily opened and re-sealed with sellotape. This had now ceased. In addition a parcel delivered to her home on the 11th March this year, had also been opened and interferred with. She also thought her telephone had been tapped because of the strange noises it sometimes made.

110. The journalist inferred that her professional interest in the death of Hilda MURRELL could directly be connected with the tampering of her mail and telephone and suggesting that government agents could be involved. She was unable to offer any other reason why she should be singled out for such treatment and could not support the speculation with any fact.

111. Enquiries show that Judith COOK did not report any of these matters to British Telecom or the Local Police. When asked about the origin of the tampered letters, she claimed that all were from unconnected London locations. These facts suggest that any tampering would have occurred sometime between the letters arriving at the district sorting office and delivery. Unfortunately she had mislaid the letters.

112. Enquiries over the first quarter of 1985 for the same area reveal only one reported instance of tampered mail which occurred during the first week in April. Coincidentally the complainant was a female named B K COOK who also resides in Newlyn. She is a secretary to a Pathologist, but has no known connection with the journalist.

113. Judith COOK chooses to follow the theory that the murder motive was related to the Belgrano secrets and British Intelligence. She offered nothing factual but plenty of speculation in support of her view. She is one of two authors who have written books on the murder and its speculative theories. Her book is yet to be published. She claims to have had personal contact with Mr DALYELL on several occasions to discuss the contents of her article and many other aspects of the murder.

Document 22
Page No 96

114. The author of the other book, entitled 'The Death of a Rose Grower. Who killed Hilda MURRELL?' is Graham SMITH, a freelance contributor to many leading national daily newspapers. He also resides in Cornwall and was seen by the Review Officers at his home prior to the publication.

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

115. It had been decided to interview him and determine whether he had any useful information to assist the review and also on the recommendation of Mr DALYELL who thought that he could help. However, he had nothing useful to offer in support of any theory but was critical about the numerous inaccuracies written by Judith COOK in her article. He expressed surprise why so many inaccuracies had not been challenged by a senior officer of the West Mercia Police, considering they did nothing but tarnish the image of the Force.

116. He referred to the communication and release of information by West Mercia Police during the enquiry which he described as being poor and confusing to the public. He hinted that his book would be very critical of the West Mercia Police on some aspects of the enquiry which in his own words 'had been badly handled'.

Document 22
Page No 96

117. His book was published on the 16th April and is to some extent critical of the Police. The author is entitled to his opinion but it is the view of Mr SMITH that some of the criticism arises from a mistaken interpretation of some important aspects of the evidence.

CONCLUSIONS

118. Judith COOK's suspicions have been fully explored and there is nothing to support her fears that her home telephone had been humanly interfered with, or that the related experience with tampered mail has any connection whatsoever with the MURRELL murder. Enquiries at the highest level of British Telecom and the Post Office support this view.

Document 10
Page Nos 41-43

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

119. As concerns Mr DALYELL, 'Hansard' clearly shows that many of the questions he put to the House on the 20th December flow from Judith COOK's article in the 'New Statesman'. The questions were framed around a lot of inaccurate material, some of which has been identified in paragraphs 104 and 107 of this report. His confident and sensational allegations of a conspiracy to cover up the facts by the Police, Forensic Science and British Intelligence seem to have rapidly grown from the publication of the article.

120. Mr DALYELL has chosen not to identify the source which could establish the truth about an incident involving the loss of a life and the increasing speculation that has grown around it. Considering the seriousness of her death a lot of people think he should be reminded that he has spent the last two years accusing the Government of doing something similar over the Belgrano issue. Nevertheless his confidentiality with the source has to be respected.

121. Whilst being questioned by the Review Officers in Newcastle, it soon became obvious that most of Mr DALYELL's information and speculation about the case had been obtained from press statements, journalists and partly informed people on the periphery of this enquiry'. He was at times unsure of his sources and had not taken the trouble to check them. Throughout the interview he repeatedly referred to a mass of documentation and press articles placed around him.

122. He has an obsession with the Belgrano Affair which frequently clouds his judgement. However, this does not mean in any way that his allegations and speculation towards the Belgrano theory can, or must, be lightly dismissed. He is an experienced and respected Politician with 22 years in the House, who has a base line of credibility on this subject by uncovering information on the Belgrano Affair from a seemingly unlikely source which turned out to be accurate.

123. Unless the offence is detected, his firm belief that the murder was an accidental by-product of a Belgrano related search by British Intelligence may never be challenged. However, it could possibly be supported by further information from his source. Unfortunately as it stands, his information contains no hard evidence in support of his claims.

124. Mr DALYELL has persisted in different ways to allege a conspiracy between West Mercia Police and the Home Office, to cover up his version of the circumstances that Miss MURRELL died at the hands of British Intelligence officers. The time now seems appropriate to explore some of the theories, speculations and rumours in greater detail. As things stand, all of the innuendoes in the minds of many people are still unbelievable, but they are no less valid, short of detecting a burglar, than the senior investigators view that the offence was committed by a trespasser in pursuance of theft.

MR R W COZENS, QPM - HOME OFFICE APPOINTMENT

125. During an interview with Mr SMITH and Detective Superintendent HALL on the 18th March in Newcastle, Mr DALYELL inferred that his alleged cover up conspiracy had been given added strength by the recent appointment of Mr COZENS to a Home Office post on retirement from the Police Service. A similar suggestion had been published in the 'Private Eye' magazine.

CONCLUSION

126. The review officer has failed to find any evidence that Mr COZENS appointment was in any way encouraged or favoured by him being party to any known cover up with anyone to hide the true facts of the MURRELL enquiry. The post was advertised nationally and his selection followed the normal process.

Document 12
Page No 59

Document 23
Page No 97

SUSPENSION OF THREE DETECTIVES

Document 24
Page No 98

127. On 31st of December, Mr DALYELL publicly suggested that three detectives suspended from the enquiry had been punished after objecting to being told that the case was one which should not come to a proper outcome. The following two paragraphs put the reasons for their suspension into proper perspective.

Statement File
Page Nos 93-96

128. Whilst supposedly working on the murder, three detectives played golf without permission. One of them namely Detective Sergeant 25 David Anthony PATERSON is a member of the West Mercia Police. Detective Constable 1494 Robert ALSOP who was also a member of the same force and Detective Sergeant John Alan BURTON of the West Midlands Force, have since resigned.

129. Enquiries aroused suspicion of serious criminal and disciplinary offences, which were reported to their Deputy Chief Constables, who implemented disciplinary procedures and caused them to be suspended from duty whilst matters were fully investigated. After considering advice from the Director of Public Prosecutions, a decision has been made to discipline the West Mercia Detective Sergeant and this matter is sub-judice.

CONCLUSION

130. The Police enquiry was closely reviewed but there was nothing to suggest that there was any other reason for their suspension, considering the account given in the previous paragraph. All three officers were interviewed by the review team and they were most emphatic that it had never been suggested by anyone that they should curb their efforts to detect the murder. They all scorned the suggestion that they were part of a police attempt to cover up the facts. Mr SMITH discounts this unfounded and unsavoury allegation out of hand.

LINK - DETECTIVE CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT D COLE, QPM and GCHQ

Document 25
Page No 99

131. On the 9th January 1985, whilst being interviewed by a reporter of the Shropshire Star, Mr DALYELL inferred that another good link in the cover-up chain was the relationship made between Detective Chief Superintendent D COLE, QPM and GCHQ whilst dealing with the Geoffrey PRIME spy case. He inferred that whilst dealing with this matter the officer would have had an opportunity to learn much about the Intelligence Services and develop a good and close working relationship. This would prompt and make it easier for both services to cover up the alleged 'state crime'.

CONCLUSION

132. This allegation has been pursued at the highest levels of national security. Not one shred of evidence has been found to support the theory that Mr COLE's National Security contacts formed when dealing with PRIME, have had any affect or influence on decisions he has been required to make throughout the MURRELL enquiry. Mr SMITH discounts this theory as there is nothing to suggest that anything has undermined the officers determination to apprehend the killer of Hilda MURRELL.

FBI INVOLVEMENT

Document 26
Page No 100

133. Mr DALYELL has also led claims that the FBI were involved in the investigation into the death of Miss MURRELL. He tabled a parliamentary question asking for details of their involvement in the murder investigation at a time when a full explanation had already been released to the media and press. He intimated a possible line of conspiracy between the British Intelligence Service, the FBI and West Mercia Police.

134. The only FBI association throughout the long enquiry was when West Mercia Police, who have never felt reluctant to seek help from any source, asked their advice. They forwarded data of the offender collected over a number of months to the FBI Behavioural Science Research Department, seeking a personality profile.

135. Extracts of their reply were circulated through the media describing the offender as a white man in his 30's, uncertain temper, has a liking for drink who is probably unskilled and living or working locally. This personality profile was aligned to the views already formed by the senior investigating officer.

CONCLUSION

136. The review team established that the only reason for communicating with the FBI was that clearly outlined in the foregoing paragraphs. Mr SMITH is firmly of the opinion that other than providing a personality profile the FBI have not been concerned in any other enquiries into the death of the deceased rose grower.

SPECIAL BRANCH

137. On the 20th December 1984, Mr DALYELL told members in the House of Commons that he thought it was strange that Special Branch officers had been called into the investigation of the MURRELL murder. He used this as another example to support a view that British Intelligence Officers had killed her and that a similar Police Specialist Squad had been engaged to cover up. This, to a great degree, carried the same innuendo as the FBI allegation.

138. Enquiries reveal that the Special Branch of West Mercia Police gave assistance, mainly to support and ease the huge manpower demands made upon the enquiry and also to investigate the Sizewell 'B' theory.

Document 10
Page No 43

Document 27
Page No 101

CONCLUSION

139. It is accepted throughout the Service that specialist officers are often called upon to perform non-specialist roles when the manpower demands are great. In this particular case, Special Branch officers did lend their support for that reason.

140. Mr SMITH finds no unusual significance at all in the way Special Branch officers were engaged to work in this particular instance. There is not one shred of evidence to even suggest any conspiracy to cover up the true facts between the West Mercia Police Special Branch and British Intelligence.

141. The foregoing paragraphs have been directed towards speculation of a cover up between British Intelligence and West Mercia Police. The following paragraphs are used to examine and review speculation in support of a 'state crime'.

SPECULATION - FRANCIS PYM

142. In a half hour television programme 'Wales This Week', on the 24th January this year, screened by HTV, concerning Miss MURRELL, Mr DALYELL implied that the same source who had told him that British Intelligence were responsible for her death had now asked him to take note of what happened when Mr PYM's Parliamentary Office was searched in March 1984. Mr DALYELL linked this incident to the time he started asking the Government embarrassing questions about the Belgrano Affair. He implied that the search was for Belgrano leaks and that in support of his theory, there may be some connection with the Shrewsbury murder.

143. Responding to this, Mr SMITH and Detective Superintendent HALL visited the House of Commons on the 25th March and confirmed that on an unknown date sometime in March or early April 1984, Mr PYM had discovered that papers left lying on the desk in his Parliamentary Office had been disturbed. Nothing had been stolen.

144. Both Mr PYM and his secretary firmly believe that the motive for searching was to find material for a book he was writing titled 'The Politics of Consent'. The book was published on the 26th June 1984, by Hamish-Hamilton and makes no reference at all to the Falklands Conflict. However, Mr PYM was aware that around this time strong rumours were circulating suggesting that when published, his book would be critical of the Prime Minister.

145. Some two months before this incident Mr PYM's Parliamentary Office was entered and a clock radio valued £25 was stolen. Chief Superintendent SLESSER, Head of Security for Westminster Palace, states that petty thefts of this nature occasionally occur, but he had no reason to attach any sinister or political connotation to this particular one.

CONCLUSION

146. Having exhausted this line of enquiry, the Review team have not discovered anything to support DALYELL's suggestion that the search of Mr PYM's desk was in any way linked with the leak of Belgrano secrets or the death of Hilda MURRELL. The timing of the murder and the search of the Parliamentary Office are the only compatible factors to emerge. In the absence of any further supportive

evidence Mr SMITH feels compelled to dismiss this as a piece of unfounded speculation and supports the motive for searching the office explained in paragraph 144.

SPECULATION - CECIL WOOLF

147. Mr Cecil WOOLF and his wife are book publishers who reside at 1 Mornington Place, NW1, a good class dwelling house. They have in the past published two books for Mr DALYELL. On the 1st April they published a book titled 'Death of a Rose Grower - Who killed Hilda MURRELL?' The author is Graham SMITH previously referred to in paragraphs 114 to 117.

Document 22
Page No 96

148. During the night of the 19th/20th February 1985, their home was forcibly entered but nothing was stolen or disturbed. On the evening preceeding the offence Mr WOOLF had formally agreed over the telephone with Graham SMITH to publish the book. Mr DALYELL has said, through the media, that he finds the burglary extraordinary, suggesting it as another instance where there is a positive link with the murder of Miss Hilda MURRELL.

Document 29
Page No 103

Document 30
Page No 104

149. The Review team have personally made enquiries in London into the circumstances of the burglary. They have interviewed Mr B J HOWARD, a civilian scientific aids officer who first visited the scene and Detective Chief Inspector J BROWN who supervised the investigation. Both firmly believe that there is nothing unusual about this offence and have no reason to suspect that it has any sinister or political connotations.

Statement File
Page Nos 97 & 98
Statement File
Page Nos 99 & 100

150. It is pertinent to mention that the Modus Operandi of the offence is consistent with 20 similar burglaries reported within a close proximity of Mornington Place during the same month.

Statement File
Page No 100

CONCLUSION

151. Nothing has been established to suggest any sinister or political motives for the burglary and there seems little doubt that the sole intention was to steal. Other than the link between the publisher, writer and subject of the book, Mr SMITH finds no other information to suggest that the incident was anything but a normal case of house burglary.

SPECULATION - COMMANDER HURST

152. Commander HURST at the time of the Falklands War was working at Naval Headquarters, Northwood, Middlesex, together with Commander GREEN the nephew of the deceased. He held an intelligence post but retired from the Navy in March 1984. He claims that during his service he has had access to more confidential information than Commander GREEN.

153. His permanent address is 29 Beaconsfield Road, Yeovil, but during the week, for convenience of work, he resides in a flat at 10 Village Court, Twyford Road, Jersey Farm, St Albans. This is situated on a small private estate and was forcibly entered on Thursday, 20th December 1984, when a collection of spirits totalling £47.05 were stolen. A connection between the burglary, the Belgrano Affair and Hilda MURRELL was suggested in an article published on 16th January 1985, in the Daily Mirror.

Document 31
Page Nos 105-107

Document 32
Page No 108

Statement File
Page Nos 101-103
Statement File
Page Nos 104 & 105

154. Whilst making enquiries in Hertfordshire, the Review Team interviewed Detective Chief Inspector J S COVENEY the Head of Hertfordshire Police Special Branch and also Detective Chief Inspector M G HOWLEY, the Divisional Head of CID for St Albans, the area where the burglary occurred.

155. Mr HURST was personally seen and although he claimed to have an open mind about the offence he did suspect that his flat telephone was tapped and because of his Intelligence background had reported the suspicion to Naval Security. He also has the same fears about his home telephone in Yeovil and the one installed at 12 Ladbrooke Square, London, a flat owned by him.

Statement File
Page No 105

156. It is a fact that there has been a number of similar burglaries in St Albans and looking to an area within one mile of HURST's flat there were five similar offences committed in December 1984 and four more during the following month.

157. Enquiries at Admiralty House, London, the home of Naval Intelligence, confirm that Commander HURST did report his suspicions about his flat telephone to Captain P BATES of Naval Security who did not place any significance to this. Enquiries at high levels in British Telecom have failed to show any recorded faults relating to HURST's home telephone at Yeovil, his St Albans or London flats. The same applies to his fears of 'phone tapping at all three residences.

CONCLUSIONS

158. The review officer cannot find any connection at all to support the speculation by Commander HURST that any of his telephones have been subjected to human interference or that the burglary at his home was in any way linked with a search for secrets relating either to the Belgrano leaks or the murder of Hilda MURRELL. There is a total absence of anything which could suggest that the burglary had any sinister or political connotations, and Mr SMITH firmly believes that the offence was nothing more than one of a series of burglaries in pursuance of theft.

SPECULATION - DELWYN WILLIAMS

159. Delwyn WILLIAMS who is a Shrewsbury Solicitor and ex MP appeared on the HTV production of 'Wales Today' screened on the 7th February of this year. During the programme he claimed, based on a conversation with an engineer, that only the green wire had been disconnected from the telephone junction box in the deceased's breakfast room. He further said that in view of the relationship between Miss MURRELL and Commander GREEN, he would have been surprised and in fact upset if our Secret Services or CIA had not been looking at the home of the deceased, bearing in mind the Belgrano leaks.

160. He continued with this theory but did not think for one moment that either service killed her, but felt that their presence in the house had, in the long term, interfered with Police enquiries and that they should say so.

161. Following the programme he was seen at his Shrewsbury office by the review officers, where he retracted his earlier views and admitted that he had been misled in respect of the green wire theory and readily accepted the Police version of an unprofessional disconnection.

162. As regards the Security Services and CIA theories, he admitted this was purely speculation and that the terminology used was merely a random choice.

CONCLUSIONS

163. It seems obvious that Mr WILLIAMS had been caught up in the local speculation and rumour which suggested that only the green wire had been disconnected from the junction box in the breakfast room. He now fully accepts a factual Police account.

SPECULATION - (1) JOHN OSMOND and (2) DAVID WILLIAMS

164. John OSMOND and David WILLIAMS are both journalists employed by Harlech TV. Mr OSMOND researched the material which was used in the two documentaries screened on the 24th January and the 7th February this year, both of which were presented by Mr WILLIAMS. It was recommended by Mr DALYELL that Mr OSMOND could be of assistance to the review officers and because of this they saw him at his home in Cardiff on the 29th April, with Mr WILLIAMS.

165. During the interview both journalists expounded on various theories but it soon became obvious that neither had anything new to add and that their information for the programme was derived from Police, media sources and persons who knew Hilda MURRELL.

166. They were very critical of the West Mercia Police for the three day lapse before finding the body and criticised the way in which, in their opinion, they had been poorly treated. Both felt that the overall circumstances did not lend themselves fully to the burglary gone wrong theory, although they had nothing to support their belief.

CONCLUSIONS

167. It is quite obvious that neither journalist had one shred of evidence which would assist the review officers or support their speculative theories, many of which had been screened during the programmes. Although they were very critical of the way West Mercia Police had handled the media they were not able to be specific on any particular issue.

SPECULATION - JOHN CONWAY

Document 33
Page No 109
Document 33
Page No 110

168. Almost at the end of the review a letter was received from John CONWAY who wrote to Mr SMITH at the suggestion of Mr DALYELL. He enclosed a copy of a letter he had sent to the Chief Constable of West Mercia Police on the 15th January this year which was not acknowledged. The basis of the letter inferred that the MURRELL murder was a state cover up, a common feature in the murder of Helen SMITH, Janice WESTON and Police Inspector MacLENNAN who was found dead with gun shot wounds five years ago in Hong Kong having committed suicide.

169. The letter inferred that he had recently discussed the MURRELL case with Commander GREEN. It also stated that Dr David OWEN MP had sensed the growing unease in the minds of the press and public which had prompted him to ask for a public enquiry. Mr CONWAY claimed that he had reconstructed the events of the MURRELL murder which made him suspect that the circumstances were far removed from the official version and because of this, he was offering his help.

170. He was seen at Nuneaton Police Station by the review officers on the 30th April. He is an ex Metropolitan Police officer who resigned from the service in 1951 because, as he claims, the Superintendent was blocking his way for promotion to Sergeant. He seems obsessed in his efforts to pursue attempts to have an enquiry into the circumstances surrounding the death of Police Inspector John MacLENNAN, whom he feels was murdered by State security officers in Hong Kong. He talks of a subsequent cover up with a conspiracy involving lawyers, forensic scientists and people in the higher echelons of Hong Kong Government.

SPECULATION - JOHN CONWAY

Document 33
Page No 109
Document 33
Page No 110

168. Almost at the end of the review a letter was received from John CONWAY who wrote to Mr SMITH at the suggestion of Mr DALYELL. He enclosed a copy of a letter he had sent to the Chief Constable of West Mercia Police on the 15th January this year which was not acknowledged. The basis of the letter inferred that the MURRELL murder was a state cover up, a common feature in the murder of Helen SMITH, Janice WESTON and Police Inspector MacLENNAN who was found dead with gun shot wounds five years ago in Hong Kong having committed suicide.

169. The letter inferred that he had recently discussed the MURRELL case with Commander GREEN. It also stated that Dr David OWEN MP had sensed the growing unease in the minds of the press and public which had prompted him to ask for a public enquiry. Mr CONWAY claimed that he had reconstructed the events of the MURRELL murder which made him suspect that the circumstances were far removed from the official version and because of this, he was offering his help.

170. He was seen at Nuneaton Police Station by the review officers on the 30th April. He is an ex Metropolitan Police officer who resigned from the service in 1951 because, as he claims, the Superintendent was blocking his way for promotion to Sergeant. He seems obsessed in his efforts to pursue attempts to have an enquiry into the circumstances surrounding the death of Police Inspector John MacLENNAN, whom he feels was murdered by State security officers in Hong Kong. He talks of a subsequent cover up with a conspiracy involving lawyers, forensic scientists and people in the higher echelons of Hong Kong Government.

Document 34
Page No 111

175. Following this programme Mr BURNS was seen in London by the review officers. When asked to expound on the remark that he had been told much the same thing on an unattributable basis, he said that his contact had no hard evidence but was merely speculating about one of a number of possibilities in this matter.

CONCLUSIONS

Document 34
Page No 111

176. It is quite obvious that Mr BURNS had no information which would assist the review officers to either evaluate speculation or help the criminal investigation into the murder of Hilda MURRELL.

177. Before proceeding to examine the Sizewell 'B' speculation, it is of interest to know that Mr DALYELL, who described himself as a most pro-nuclear Politician, dismisses out of hand any later allegation that nuclear power had any connection with the murder of Hilda MURRELL

SPECULATION - SIZEWELL 'B'

178. Certain suggestions and theories have been voiced that Hilda MURRELL may have been killed because of her strong opposition to nuclear power. Therefore, it is of relevance to look into her background and give a true picture of her anti-nuclear involvement.

179. Hilda MURRELL's political seam was liberal although she was a member of T.A.C.T. - Tories Against Cruise Trident. She had a strong sense of mission and was known to support the European Nuclear Disarmament Group. She travelled to London in October 1983 to take part in a huge demonstration organised by the CND against cruise missiles. She was deeply concerned about, and strongly opposed to, nuclear power and in particular the disposal of atomic waste.

180. She was active in the Shrewsbury area fully supporting the ECOROPA Ltd., the European Ecological Group. She educated herself in nuclear physics and read broadly. She is said to have discussed these subjects with nuclear scientists and was in principal, strongly opposed to the Sizewell 'B' project as concerns radio active wastage.

181. The Sizewell 'B' public enquiry was held at the Snape Maltings in Suffolk and lasted more than 2 years being completed in March 1985. It considered the proposals of the CEGB to build a pressurised water reactor nuclear power station on the site of an existing one on the Suffolk coast at Sizewell.

182. It is known that she had discussed at some length with Dr D G ARNOTT a nuclear scientist, topics about radio active waste. Mr G W MORGAN-GRENVILLE who also opposes nuclear power, spoke to the deceased several times by telephone discussing her research, although they never met. Their relationship to the deceased is subject to wider comment later in paragraphs 197 to 212.

Statement File
Page Nos 106-110

183. Two weeks before her death she applied to give evidence as an ordinary citizen' at the Sizewell 'B' nuclear enquiry. Her paper, 'An ordinary citizen's view', was directed against the Governments attitude on nuclear waste management. Because of her death, Commander GREEN read the paper to the enquiry and he claims that the contents were acknowledged in professional circles to be an excellent exposition of the problems of nuclear waste. It did not contain any information which posed fresh threats to the nuclear industry.

Document 35
Page Nos 112-135

184. The deceased kept a very detailed diary which she completed up to and including the day before her murder. The document was used to record her daily movements and personal thoughts. The contents have failed to reveal anything which would tend to suggest that she was in fear or under threat.

185. Miss MURRELL spent most of her leisure time at a wooden chalet in the Welsh border area of Llanymynech. This was her retreat where she got great enjoyment from walking, birdwatching and planting and nurturing some exotic and rare plants. After her death the chalet became the subject of speculation in more ways than one which are discussed in paragraphs 233 to 249.

SPECULATION - COMMANDER R GREEN

186. Commander GREEN finds it difficult to accept the theory of Detective Chief Superintendent D COLE that his aunt's death resulted from a burglary that went wrong. Commander GREEN, although appreciating Mr DALYELL's interest, does not believe her murder was related in any way to the sinking of the Belgrano, and is most upset at the embarrassment this has caused him and his wife. He has never met the MP and has no intention of doing so.

187. When interviewed on the 21st March at his home in Dorset by Mr SMITH and Detective Superintendent HALL, Commander GREEN spoke of his belief that Miss MURRELL was murdered because of her anti nuclear views after disturbing agents in her home seeking Sizewell 'B' papers. This 'state crime' theory is widely held by her close friends and relatives. When asked to explain why the Sizewell papers, which were openly lying on the breakfast room table, had not been stolen by the offender(s), he

reasoned that it was more likely for trained Government Agents to photograph the documents, leaving the originals behind to divert opinion towards an assumption that the offence was nothing but a burglary gone wrong.

Statement File
Page No 108

188. When asked to support the theory that his aunt had enemies, he referred to a telephone conversation which Mr MORGAN-GRENVILLE and his aunt had shared shortly before her death where she is alleged to have said, 'if they don't get me first I hope to show that at least one old woman has seen through their lies.' Mr SMITH told Commander GREEN that the existence of this conversation was not known until at least 4 days after her death and yet on the day her body was discovered he had telephoned the West Mercia Police informing them of his fears because of her anti nuclear background. He claimed that Dr ARNOTT had informed him that she had made enemies.

Document 36
Page No 136

189. He was very critical of the way West Mercia Police had handled some aspects of the enquiry, especially the 3 day events leading up to the body being found. He found the Police explanation unacceptable and said that this opinion was shared by many people who were close to his aunt.

190. When visiting Shrewsbury Police Station following her death, he had been told by a Detective that the main reason why they had not acted on two reports about the abandoned Renault was because a computer error had shown the owner as living in Scotland and that it had taken 2 days to locate the person. He had accepted this as the truth but has since learnt different. There is no reason to challenge this but the officer alleged to have told him has never been identified.

191. Commander GREEN is afraid that his home telephone is tapped and thinks that the line fault at his aunt's chalet at Llanymynech was most extraordinary and coincidental with the disconnection at her Shrewsbury home.

192. He asked the review officers to make the Chief Constable of West Mercia Police fully aware that like many others he was terribly disappointed at their lack of interest to investigate the speculative theories. He felt that until this had been properly done he could not consider the burglary gone wrong theory of the senior investigating officer. He was also concerned that the arson attack at the Llanymynech chalet may have been an attempt to intimidate him to stop pursuing his own investigation into her mysterious death.

Document 37
Page No 137

CONCLUSIONS

193. Commander GREEN was found to be a very serious and intelligent man who genuinely believes that his aunt was killed by some agent connected with the nuclear power industry. His concern about the lack of Police action leading up to the discovery of the body is understandable and the version about the PNC check computer error has only helped to sow in his own mind, more seeds of a Police cover up.

194. The fears that his home telephone was subjected to human interference have been dispelled by a high level enquiry at British Telecom and his apprehension of the line fault at the chalet at Llanymynech has been fully investigated and the cause is explained in paragraph 235.

195. As regards his feelings about the arson at the Llanymynech chalet being motivated to stop his own enquiry into her death, there is not one shred of evidence to support this theory.

196. In the absence of any evidence to support his theories Mr SMITH believes that Commander GREEN is swayed towards his 'state crime' motive by the 'New Statesman' article which was the first to suggest that her death might be connected with her anti nuclear views. In addition, the enormous amount of speculation on many issues which has seemed to generate more sinister connotations has helped sow the theory of a Police cover up in his mind.

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

Statement File
Page Nos 106-110

SPECULATION - GERARD WYNDHAM MORGAN-GRENVILLE

197. He is a Director of 11 companies and Chairman of two charitable causes. These are the Society for Environmental Improvement and ECOROPA Ltd., a European Ecological Group whose main concern is the opposition to nuclear power. The deceased was known to be a generous donor to this latter cause. His leadership to distribute 7 million anti nuclear leaflets throughout Europe shows his commitment. He attended public school where Mr DALYELL was a classmate. They have recently lunched together in the House of Commons.

198. On Wednesday, 27th March 1985, the review officers saw MORGAN-GRENVILLE at his home in Mid Wales where he told them that he had been somewhat instrumental in the production of two television documentaries seen by HTV viewers concerning the death of Hilda MURRELL. He is known personally to John OSMOND, the programme researcher. When asked to see correspondence the deceased had sent him, he said it was unavailable. This was unusual as he had publicly criticised West Mercia Police for not asking to see it.

He confirmed the contents of her last telephone call as referred to in paragraph 188.

199. He directs criticism towards the West Mercia Police, claiming the Chief Constable had too lightly dismissed, without investigation, the vast amount of speculation which the murder had generated.

200. Over a period of two to three years, prior to her death, the deceased had telephoned and written to MORGAN-GRENVILLE seeking advice or opinion on a number of issues concerning the nuclear industry. He had suggested that one of her papers be reworked as evidence for the Sizewell Enquiry.

Statement File
Page Nos 106-107

201. He could offer little assistance and supported the theory that her death was, in some way, to silence dissident opinion of a declared objector to the Sizewell 'B' project. He voiced the opinion that the Police and Government Departments were conspiring to cover up the true facts. However, he did not offer any information to support either theory.

CONCLUSIONS

202. Mr MORGAN-GRENVILLE is totally committed against nuclear power. It is easy to understand why he is swayed towards the Sizewell 'B' theory if consideration is placed on his background coupled with the final telephone conversation he allegedly had with the deceased. He dismisses out of hand the burglary gone wrong theory and says he is not in isolation with criticism levelled towards the West Mercia Police. He feels that there is so much contradictory evidence an enquiry should be held into the way the case has been handled. His main criticism seemed to be that the Police had failed to investigate the vast amount of speculation which encourages his support for the cover up theory.

Statement File
Page Nos 109-110

Statement File
Page No 108

203. It could well be that his anti nuclear obsession has had some influence on him leaning towards the Sizewell Agent theory.

SPECULATION - DR D G ARNOTT

204. Dr ARNOTT, a nuclear scientist, has in the past been employed by the Atomic Energy Authority. He has also worked in the field of nuclear medicine and served on a Government Committee which formulated codes of practice for handling radio active material. In 1979 he returned from abroad to reside in North Wales and became an active campaigner against the Bore Hole scheme for nuclear waste. His name was included on the Secretariat's list of principal objectors to the Sizewell 'B' Project.

Document 38
Page No 139

205. On Wednesday, 27th March 1985, he was seen at his North Wales home by the review officers. He spoke of how the deceased had visited his home on three or four occasions discussing at some length several topics surrounding nuclear waste. Surprisingly, he did not know that she was preparing a paper for the enquiry. He claims that it was only after her death that he had identified large tracts in her report accountable to himself.

Document 35
Page Nos 112-135

206. Dr ARNOTT has no evidence of security involvement in her murder but with hindsight, recalls that some papers relating to a costing exercise of Sizewell objectors went missing from his home. His timing for this incident was shortly after the first meeting of the Sizewell enquiry which would be in the summer of 1982. He did not report the occurrence to the Police and the Sizewell 'B' Enquiry Secretariat confirm that they were never informed.

Document 38
Page No 139

207. He speculates only on the Sizewell 'B' aspect and discounts the Belgrano theory out of hand. He firmly believes that he was singled out as being a principal danger by the CEGB to the public enquiry but cannot support this view with any reasons.

Document 39
Page Nos 140-141

208. Since the speculation that private detectives from the Zeus Agency had allegedly vetted some objectors, and possibly the deceased woman, Dr ARNOTT feels compelled to believe that any interest they may have had in him could well have been projected from the visits he received from Miss MURRELL. His base for speculation is drawn only from this sequence of events which he accepts as a good reason for linking them together as Sizewell Security targets.

209. He also believes that the semen found on the handkerchief and under garment of the deceased woman, originated from a sperm bank and had been withdrawn and injected with a syringe on the clothing by Government agents laying a false trail to direct enquiries towards the burglary theory.

210. Dr ARNOTT strongly criticises the failure by West Mercia Police to consider any other possibilities besides their own assessment that her death resulted from a burglary gone wrong. He is quick to emphasise that people like himself will continue to campaign until such time as all speculation has been properly investigated and evaluated.

CONCLUSIONS

211. Dr ARNOTT is firm in the belief that Miss MURRELL's murder was motivated by her objections to certain aspects of the Sizewell 'B' Project, together with her anti nuclear views.

His theory about the sperm being planted by agents can, to a great extent, be discounted. Scientific analysis of the sperm found on her clothing suggests it is highly likely that it came from a person who has had a vasectomy or is a natural aspermic. It would be unusual for specimens of this nature to find their way into a sperm bank.

Document 39
Page Nos 140 & 141

212. He also believes that Hilda MURRELL along with some other objectors to the enquiry, had all been vetted by private detectives from Zeus Agency. This made her a vulnerable target for security checks. This particular theory is dispelled by evidence that the enquiry made by Zeus Agency in relation to Sizewell objectors never had any interest in either the deceased woman or Dr ARNOTT. The contents of the following paragraphs 213 to 232 completely dismiss this piece of speculation.

Document 43
Page Nos 149-156

SPECULATION - PEACHMAN - PRIVATE INVESTIGATOR

Document 40
Page Nos 142-143

213. On the 27th January 1985, Mr DALYELL wrote a letter to the Chief Constable of West Mercia Police, claiming that he had been informed from an undisclosed source that there may be some connection between the death of Miss MURRELL and the suicide of Barry Charles PEACHMAN, 47 years. His death had occurred at Newton Flotman, Norfolk on Tuesday, 17th April 1984, shortly after the murder of Miss MURRELL. He had put a gun to his head and killed himself. PEACHMAN was Managing Director of Sapphire Investigations Bureau based in Long Stratton, Norfolk.

Document 39
Page Nos 140 & 141

214. On the very same day as Mr DALYELL's letter, an article appeared in the Observer which encouraged the Sizewell 'B' theory by suggesting that objectors to the project were the target of secret surveillance by a private detective agency linked with British Intelligence. The article suggested that the Zeus Security Consultants managed by Peter HAMILTON, were the private detectives

involved. They claimed that this firm was hired to monitor the objectors by a private client and the work was then passed on for enquiry to the Contingency Services of Colchester.

Document 39
Page No 140 & 141

215. According to the Observer, the purpose of the exercise was to obtain the identities of principal objectors to the project, any media connections and political leanings etc. The underlying theme suggested that because Miss MURRELL was a principal objector, this may have led her to disturbing private detectives in her home seeking information about her Sizewell 'B' objections. An article, with similar meaning appeared in the March 1985 edition of 'Searchlight', the anti fascist monthly.

Document 41
Page Nos 144-146

216. Following the screening of a 'Crime Watch' television programme on the 14th March 1985, used to reconstruct the murder, an anonymous male caller claiming to have worked for the MI5 rang the studio with information which strongly suggested that PEACHMAN should be closely looked at for the murder of Miss MURRELL. The caller said that PEACHMAN's brief was to monitor anti nuclear and Sizewell objectors for the Government, and furthermore that he had been actively engaged in doing so 10 months prior to the murder. The caller was 'unknown'.

Document 42
Page Nos 147 & 148

217. The revelation that private investigators were monitoring Sizewell objectors and the information contained in the previous four paragraphs, prompted Mr SMITH to immediately investigate the matter. The following paragraphs reveal the outcome.

Document 43
Page No 149

218. In January 1983, a London firm of Solicitors were instructed by a large corporate client to determine how some confidential internal memoranda had been leaked and shown in a TV documentary causing acute embarrassment.

The documents related to a projected nuclear power station to be built overseas. At that time the Sizewell enquiry was running and it was thought that the leak may possibly have come from someone employed by the corporate client who was an anti nuclear sympathiser or a principal objector to the Sizewell project.

Document 43
Page No 149

219. In late January 1983, the London firm of solicitors instructed Zeus Security Consultants to obtain the identity of principal objectors to the Sizewell enquiry in an effort to determine the outlet for the leaks. The work was then passed on to PEACHMAN's firm, Sapphire Investigations Bureau, who in turn sub-contracted the enquiry to Contingency Services of Colchester, a firm run by Adrian HAMPSON alias Victor NORRIS. The latter named obtained a list of objectors from the Sizewell 'B' Enquiry Secretariat, a facility that is available to anyone. The information was then transferred to Sapphire Investigations.

Statement File
Page Nos 111 & 112

Document 43
Page Nos 151-156

220. On or about 31st January 1983, the London solicitors received a four page reply listing a number of principal objectors to Sizewell 'B'. A week later a follow-up list was also received but nothing was discovered to assist in identifying the source of leaks to the media. Neither Miss MURRELL or Dr ARNOTT were referred to in those lists. It is a fact that PEACHMAN and HAMPSON never had any interest in Hilda MURRELL.

CONCLUSIONS

Document 43
Page Nos 151-156
Statement File
Page Nos 111 & 112
Document 43
Page Nos 151-154

221. It is true that Contingency Services on the 25th and 31st January 1983, did obtain lists from the Sizewell 'B' Enquiry Secretariat identifying persons and organisations known to be principal objectors to the scheme. This information was eventually received by the London firm of solicitors through Sapphire Investigations Bureau and Zeus Consultants. Following this, the solicitors did not ask any of these private investigators to carry out further checks.

Document 43
Page Nos 149-156

222. The review officers travelled to London and interviewed Mr Christopher Peter TOOTAL a partner in the firm of Herbert SMITH and Company, Solicitors, 35/37 Cannon Street, London EC40. He conducted the business referred to in the previous paragraphs on behalf of a large corporate client whose identity he did not wish to disclose.

Document 38
Page No 138

223. It is not surprising that Miss MURRELL's name did not appear on the list obtained from the Sizewell 'B' Enquiry Secretariat, as it was not until some 7 months later, in August 1983 that she first declared any official interest in the Project. This helps to rule out the suggestion that PEACHMAN could have murdered her as there was no known connection between them.

Document 38
Page Nos 138-139

224. The review officers travelled to Oxford and interviewed Mr C MATTHEWS, Assistant to the Secretary of the Sizewell 'B' Enquiry. The Secretary, Dr D P HAUSER later confirmed in writing the facts quoted in paragraph 220 and also categorically stated that it was never part of the Secretariat's role to investigate any party to the Enquiry whether they were recorded as principal objectors or not. He emphasised that investigations were never instituted against Miss MURRELL and that the CEGB did not commission any private firm of investigators to do so.

225. Finally, the review officers visited the Headquarters of the Central Electricity Generating Board in London.

Document 44
Page No 157

226. They interviewed Mr P HOLLIDAY, Head of Security for CEGB and Mr R K DREW, the Head of Professional Services, who for the past 4 years has been in charge of the team which was responsible for carrying out the Sizewell 'B' enquiry. They had no knowledge of Miss MURRELL until the Autumn of 1983 and confirmed that at no time did the CEGB investigate Miss MURRELL or any other objector to Sizewell 'B'.

Statement File
Page Nos 118-132

227. Reading the Inquest File on PEACHMAN, there is no doubt why he took his own life. For a number of years he had been having an affair with a female director of his firm and his wife was fully aware of this. Shortly before his death, his girlfriend left the firm and broke off their long standing relationship and he had become most distressed. Extra pressure forced upon him by the Inland Revenue for tax arrears increased his worries.

Statement File
Page Nos 114-117
113-134
Document 45
Page No 158
Document 46
Page Nos 159-160

228. PEACHMAN was completely eliminated from the murder when it was established that at the material time he, together with Adrian Norman HAMPSON and his daughter Sandra GOOSE, had been on an assignment in Clare Village, Sudbury, Suffolk.

Document 40
Page Nos 142-143
Document 39
Page Nos 140-141

229. It is rather coincidental that the date on DALYELL's letter to Mr COZENS, the 27th January, was the same day as the Observer published their article on 'Private Eyes Spy on Objectors to Sizewell Probe'.

Document 39
Page Nos 140-141

230. Like many others, this article contains inaccuracies claiming a link between British Intelligence and the Private Detectives who carried out the checks. It does not relate at all to the fact that the Sizewell checks made by Contingency Services, were required by a London

based firm of solicitors who needed them for reasons which were in no way connected with Hilda MURRELL.

231. Evaluating the result of the enquiries into the Sizewell Probe by the private detectives, nothing has been revealed to connect Miss MURRELL's death with the CEGB, British Intelligence or any other agency.

232. Enquiries have completely dispelled any speculation that Barry PEACHMAN was in any way concerned in the death of Hilda MURRELL, and there is not one shred of evidence to connect them. Mr SMITH totally discounts this theory which has been destroyed by fact.

SPECULATION - TELEPHONE MALFUNCTION - LLANYMYNECH

233. On the morning of Saturday, 24th March 1984, after being notified by the Shrewsbury Police that his aunt was missing, Commander GREEN in an effort to contact her, telephoned her chalet at Llanymynech. After several unsuccessful attempts, each receiving an engaged tone, he reported the fault to British Telecom.

234. Commander GREEN has since speculated that her chalet telephone was malfunctioning because it had been humanly tampered with. He finds it too much of a coincidence to think otherwise, knowing that the telephone at the deceased's Shrewsbury home had also been simultaneously disconnected. He implied that Sizewell Agents may also have intended to search the holiday chalet for her papers and as they had done at her home, taken an early precaution to ensure there would be no line of contact if disturbed. Aspects surrounding the disconnection at her home which has given rise to growing speculation are discussed in much greater detail in paragraphs 70 to 74.

Statement File
Page Nos 135-138

235. On Monday, 26th March, Robert Edward ANDREWS, a maintenance engineer for the past 11 years, was instructed to deal with this fault and from certain tests made at the exchange in Llanymynech Village he soon detected a faulty electrode and replaced the part. The repair did not necessitate visiting the chalet as the fault was to be found in the protection unit situated a mile away. This unit had not been tampered with. He thinks that the most common causes for this fault are lightning and storm damage.

236. Councillor Derek WOODVINE appeared in a 'World in Action' television programme screened on the 4th March 1985, and openly stated that the Police account of the storm damage being responsible did not accord with a version he had been given by a local Telecom engineer. He had been told that the capacitor on the facility had been struck with a heavy instrument and damaged rendering the telephone inoperative. As a result of what he had been told he totally discarded the possibility of lightning having caused the fault claiming that there had been none recorded for that month of March.

CONCLUSION

Statement File
Page No 136

237. Accepting the evidence of Robert Edward ANDREWS, an experienced engineer, that a faulty electrode caused the continual engaged tone, then Commander GREEN's speculation that it had been humanly tampered with for malicious reasons must be totally discounted. The fact that four faults had previously been reported on the same line since 1979 tends to indicate that faults did occur and that this occurrence was not so unusual as Commander GREEN makes out.

Statement File
Page No 137

238. Although he is aware that a faulty electrode was found and that lightning or storm damage are the most common causes for this, he discounts the lightning theory with the unlikelihood of it occurring so early in the year as March.

Statement File
Page Nos 139-141

Document 47
Page No 161

Statement File
Page No 140

239. Peter John EDWARDS, an executive engineer employed by Telecom at their Shrewsbury exchange, maintains an overall weather picture which often assists him to explain varying fault rates. He cannot agree with the views of Commander GREEN and Mr WOODVINE, as from his own records lightning activity was recorded in Shrewsbury on the 27th March 1984. He knows it to be a fact that it was also present in the area over the whole of the preceeding week, which would include the Saturday when Commander GREEN rang the chalet. Mr EDWARDS further says that it is not so unusual to have lightning activity in any month of the year.

240. As regards the claims by Councillor WOODVINE about malicious damage to the capacitor, Mr SMITH can only make a judgement on the validity of this against the overwhelming evidence which disproves it and feels there is no truth at all in the information Mr WOODVINE was given.

241. Considering this with the method used to disconnect the telephone at her Shrewsbury home, there is no relationship between either fault, although Commander GREEN genuinely feels differently.

242. After making further enquiries with the most senior of national Telecom personnel, Mr SMITH is fully satisfied that the telephone line at the chalet was not subjected to any human interference or malicious damage.

SPECULATION - ARSON - CHALET, LLANYMYNECH

Document 48
Page No 162

243. At 7.50 a.m. Saturday, 26th January 1985, a fire was discovered at a remote chalet at Penyfoel, Llanymynech, Dyfed Powys, which was owned by the deceased but since bequeathed to her niece, Mrs Stella CHICK. West Mercia Police were informed of this by telex.

Statement File
Page Nos 142 & 143

Statement File
Page Nos 144-149

244. The scene was visited by Dr John FOX a forensic scientist and Detective Chief Inspector T B D REES. There were no signs of forcible entry or internal damage. Fire damage was confined to the rear of the chalet and had been started outside the back door. No accelerant was used and the fire had developed from a slow burning process culminating in a blaze to the outer timber fabric of the chalet. Damage in financial terms was £1,400.

Statement File
Page No 148

245. The incident was recorded as arson and Detective Chief Inspector REES feels that if the initial motive had been to completely destroy the chalet, the presence of nearby logs and coal would have facilitated this without any problem.

246. The officer has a wide knowledge and background about the series of holiday home fires which have persisted in North Wales, and does not include this offence as part of that series.

Document 37
Page No 137

247. Whilst being interviewed at his home in Dorset on the 21st March by the review officers, Commander GREEN the deceased's nephew, said that he was conscious that the arson at the chalet was a form of intimidation directed towards him in an effort to make him cease campaigning for the true motive of his aunt's death. He expressed the same intimidatory feelings to a reporter who published them in the Sunday Telegraph on the 27th January. He admitted that it was no more than a gut feeling and had not one shred of evidence to support his fears. His sister, Mrs CHICK, expressed a view in paragraph 255 that the fire was too close to the media to be coincidental.

CONCLUSIONS

Statement File
Page No 148

248. There can be little doubt that the fire damage to the chalet was malicious and it is the view of Detective Chief Inspector REES that it is more likely to be the work of some local person and in all probability a juvenile(s). The fire occurred two days after a HTV television programme had screened a view of the chalet.

249. Considering the facts, there is a total lack of evidence to support Commander GREEN's gut feeling, and because of this Mr SMITH could not place any connection between the fire and the speculative fear he offered.

Statement File
Page Nos 150-151

SPECULATION - MRS JOAN TATE

Document 6
Page No 24

250. She is a self employed writer who was a close friend of the deceased woman. She was mentioned in the 'New Statesman' article, 'The Death of Miss MURRELL', by the author who quoted her as saying, 'that anyone who has mentioned to the Police that the murder might possibly have something to do with the work on which Miss MURRELL had been engaged, has been made to feel excessively foolish and a number of people who came forward with different bits of information - it's called co-operation by the public - have been treated offensively.'

251. She was seen at her home in Shrewsbury by the Review officers and her comments in the article were discussed along with other aspects. She was highly critical of the three day delay in finding the body and feels that with prompter Police action Hilda MURRELL could still be alive. She seems incensed with the manner in which Detective Chief Superintendent COLE had tended to treat Shrewsbury people when they have tried to help.

Although she tended to speculate on the Belgrano and Sizewell issues, she offered nothing new in the way of information either to evaluate speculation or to assist in detecting the offender.

CONCLUSION

252. Mrs TATE is best described as a single minded person with old fashioned ideas about the Police service. She is obviously very intelligent and her keen interest in this enquiry is understandable as she was reasonably close to Hilda MURRELL. She claims never to have met Judith COOK but admits supplying her with background information by telephone.

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

253. She was critical not only of Detective Chief Superintendent COLE, but also of the local Coroner, the Pathologist and the Police. Mr SMITH questions her validity of the criticism towards Detective Chief Superintendent COLE, because she has never met him.

Statement File
Page Nos 152-157

SPECULATION - MRS STELLA CHICK

254. Mrs Stella CHICK is the niece and beneficiary of the deceased. She is the sister of Commander GREEN.

Document 48
Page No 162

255. She was interviewed at her home in Bristol by the review officers to whom she expressed a view that the fire at the chalet in Llanymynech was too close to the media to be coincidental. It is a fact that a picture of the chalet was shown on local television two days before the incident.

256. As regards to the death of her aunt, she does not believe the crime was politically motivated and refuses to support her brother in his speculative theories about Sizewell agents. She keeps an open mind on a motive for the murder.

257. She was very critical of the three day delay in finding the body and of the unusual haste to ultimately dispose of it when most of the family were going on holiday. For this she blames a lack of understanding and proper communication. However, she speaks very highly of Detective Chief Inspector C FURBUR for the excellent manner in which he communicated with her throughout and wished to thank Detective Sergeant H D PERRITON for the kind assistance in the early and traumatic days following the murder.

CONCLUSION

258. Mrs CHICK was found to be a most rational thinker and uniquely had no speculation or theories about the motive for the murder. She was one of the very few people interviewed who has a completely open mind, but if anything, would tend to lean towards the opinion of the senior investigating officer. She is without doubt pro-Police and the adverse comments she did make were thought to be sincere.

259. Her criticism about the unusual haste to get rid of the body was discussed, and she was told that because of the fast deterioration it could not be left indefinitely following the second independent Post Mortem conducted by Dr N D GOWER, MD, F.R.C.Path. This had been carried out on the instructions of the Director of Public Prosecutions, as an independent measure should anyone be subsequently charged with the offence.

260. She accepted the explanation and was informed that the arrangements for body disposal lay in the hands of the Coroner, Hospital Authorities, Undertakers and close family.

Statement File
Page Nos 158 & 159

SPECULATION - OLGA RATCLIFFE EVANS JP

261. Mrs EVANS is a strong conservationist and shared in a number of environmental interests with Hilda MURRELL. It had been suggested by Mr DALYELL that it would be of benefit for the review officers to interview her.

262. In view of this she was seen by the review officers at her Shropshire home on the 30th April. She claimed that from the early days of the enquiry she had sensed a Sizewell connection, although she can offer nothing factual to support the view. She supported various items of speculation most of which had been covered by the media, i.e. the co-incident of telephone malfunctioning at 52 Sutton Road and the chalet at Llanymynech, the need for two Post Mortems, a hasty disposal of the body and several other aspects including the three day delay in finding the body which she found inexcusable.

CONCLUSIONS

263. Quite contrary to Mr DALYELL's belief, Mrs EVANS could offer nothing constructive or factual to support the vast amount of speculation she had expounded.

CRIMINAL ENQUIRY

264. It would seem appropriate to discuss briefly the most relevant facts of the murder and to speculate as to what happened and why.

Photograph Nos
7,8,12 & 13

265. The searching of drawers and cupboards, receptacles and handbags is indicative of a normal burglar looking for cash.

266. Experience has shown that burglars do sometimes consume alcohol on premises and it is not unusual for nerves to stimulate the sexual excitement of criminals.

Statement File
Page No 6 & 7

It is appreciated there is no evidence of a physical sexual attack, but it is highly likely with semen being found on her slip and her knickers removed that some sexual activity took place.

Photograph No 9

267. It seems obvious that she was not immediately confronted when entering her home. She had put the leeks bought that morning in the pantry, and the Safeways till role was later found in the waste basket in the breakfast room. It is feasible to think that the offender came downstairs where a confrontation took place probably in the breakfast room. She may then have attempted to use the telephone to summon assistance, causing the intruder to rip the telephone wires completely away from the junction box.

Photograph No 11

268. There is little doubt that a struggle of sorts took place upstairs and the question of a broken baluster rail leaves much to speculate on i.e. was she tied to it or did she fall against it?

Photograph No 12.

269. It is highly likely that some sexual activity occurred in the smallest bedroom but to what extent remains pure conjecture. On the floor was a blanket, broken spectacles and a skirt. Lying on the bed were knickers and her white coloured semen stained handkerchief, dress, ladies suit jacket, out-door coat and a piece of material forming two loops which presumably had been used to tie her wrists or ankles. It would be reasonable to suppose that whilst in the bedroom she was subjected to some type of physical abuse (broken spectacles) and perhaps stripped.

270. The following events are probably the most difficult to understand. Why take her from the house and expose himself to the risk of being identified?

Did she know or recognise him? Did she think she was being taken for medical treatment? Who dressed her and considering the circumstances, why was she wearing a hat?

Statement File
Page Nos 160-170

271. The car journey from her home to Hunkington cannot be disputed as twelve witnesses saw them both in the Renault. A significant factor is that a motorcyclist, following directly behind saw the car pull away at a very fast speed from the second set of temporary traffic lights on Sundorne Road. It travelled away from Shrewsbury, up the hill and through the cut near the Abbey. As the witness following behind reached the brow of that hill the Renault was out of sight.

272. What can be construed from this is that a car travelling so quickly would never have negotiated the oblique right turn into Hunkington Lane unless the driver had local knowledge. Only the smallest of signs is displayed indicating this by-road. In support of this, the review officers completely missed this right turn when they travelled for the first time to the scene.

273. Once in Hunkington Lane the events are no clearer. The car came to rest and was immobile. The fact that the car keys were in her coat pocket suggests that she was in the car when it left the road. It seems she tried to make good her escape with the keys across the fields in the direction of the coppice whilst the offender was attempting to free the vehicle. It is obvious that he then pursued her.

Photograph No 17

274. The most direct route from the car to where her boot was found, approximately 370 yards away, is virtually in a straight line of wheel tracks and ruts. This part of the field is reasonably secluded and seems a most likely spot for the final assault. After attacking her it is

Photograph Nos
18,19,20,21

feasible that the offender then made his way up the side of the hedgerow, throwing the hat, knife and broken spectacles en route.

Photograph No 19

275. The theory that the attack took place where these items were found is somewhat negated because when the hat was examined in situ, the undergrowth was not flattened or disturbed consistent with a struggle. The continuance of the route would put the offender immediately back onto Hunkington Lane pointing him in the direction of Shrewsbury.

Document 3
Page No 6

276. Pathological evidence shows the cause of death as being hypothermia and it is medically acceptable, especially when a person is outdoors, that they can suffer delusions of feeling very hot when extremely cold and subsequently discard clothing whilst wandering or stumbling about until sometimes they become naked. This deteriorates the condition of the person by a further reduction in body temperature. Most of the classical symptoms of Hypothermia are present which support the explanation as to her boots being found apart and why her skirt and one sock were distanced from the body. Another symptom of Hypothermia present was the pink coloured bruising to her knees which is more likely to have been caused when crawling about than as many people have suggested, by being dragged across the fields.

Photograph Nos ,
24,25
Photograph No 27

277. Without her spectacles she was extremely handicapped and it would be normal for her to follow the outline of the hedgerow which would take Miss MURRELL to the position her body was found. Only one area of hypostasis was found and this provides classic evidence that she died in the position she was discovered, therefore weakening the suggestion of post mortem movement, which could only have happened if the body had been so quickly moved after death.

Document 5
Page No 21

278. The final area of contention relates to the runner who over a period of two hours, allegedly between 1 p.m. and 3 p.m. was seen by over 20 people in the Sundorne Road area. Some of them gave a description of the man which correlates to, and has similarities with, the person seen driving the deceased. If it is the same person then a lack of transport might encourage the belief that he was a petty burglar rather than a Government Agent.

279. It has been suggested that British Intelligence Officers were involved in the burglary at 52 Sutton Road, and the murder of Hilda MURRELL. If this is so, the individual must have panicked, left foot-wear impressions, shed semen, abducted an old lady and subsequently murdered her. This conduct does not show any level of professionalism which one might expect from a highly trained agent of the state.

INCIDENT ROOM

280. The review team spent weeks searching the incident room system which gave an opportunity to make comment on areas of administration.

281. It was evident that the enquiry had been approached by management in a most professional and methodical manner. The system was effective and the Incident Room procedures accorded with the current ACPO rules for the standardisation of major incident rooms. The room was well organised and under the positive control of the office manager.

282. Dip checks indicate that lines of enquiry and subsequent actions were being thoroughly followed up and that documentation was well updated. The policy decision taken at the outset to adopt a highly based manual system with a microcomputer back-up facility for selected indexes and research has so far proved to be effective.

However, because of the huge number of index cards the incident room records have become cumbersome and at times difficult to use, making searching and retrieval most time consuming. The combination of the manual and computerised indexing systems would have presented problems in the event of a linked enquiry which could have necessitated interfacing with other force computers.

283. It is a pity that computerised incident room training was behind due to heavy commitments with major enquiries occurring in late 1983 or early 1984. The full use of the micro-computerised indexing system would have had distinct benefits, which will no doubt be enjoyed in future major enquiries.

284. As concerns the actual operational function of the enquiry, this has been a most difficult case to handle and investigate. The West Mercia Officers can feel most satisfied with the high standard they have maintained throughout. Mr SMITH has nothing but praise for the excellent level of commitment that still prevails 13 months later. Moral is good and the mood is still confident. The review officer has closely examined a large number of suspect files and has found in most cases that enquiries have been continued in a most thorough and painstaking way. It is fortunate that the three officers who were suspended did not, through their alleged misgivings, have any adverse effect on the efficiency or effectiveness of the enquiry.

285. Mr SMITH feels that he has a duty to highlight one particular aspect of the enquiry which was most disappointing and could have had serious implications to the West Mercia force.

Document 40
Page Nos 142 & 143

286. Paragraph 213 shows that on the 27th January, Mr DALYELL wrote to the Chief Constable of West Mercia suggesting that there was a connection between the death of Miss Hilda MURRELL and Barrie PEACHMAN, a private detective, who committed suicide in April 1984. On the same day the Observer newspaper ran a story inferring that Sizewell 'B' objectors had been surveyed by private detective agencies.

Document 39
Page Nos 140 & 141

287. Although PEACHMAN had been suggested as a suspect by the MP, no positive or immediate steps were taken to follow up this line of enquiry until a similar suggestion was voiced by an anonymous caller to the 'Crimewatch UK' television programme on the 14th March. This programme reconstructed the MURRELL murder.

Document 42
Page Nos 147-148

Document 39
Page Nos 140-141

288. Since the Observer article in January, the media have made speculative mileage on this particular point, which was still rife in leading nationals as recent as the week commencing the 21st April.

Document 50
Page No 165

Statement File ,
Page Nos 115-117
133-134

Document 45
Page No 158
Document 46
Page Nos 159-160

289. Perhaps if some positive action had been taken when the original information was received, then all of the speculation that followed could have been dismissed out of hand by evidence readily available and recently obtained by the review team, which eliminates PEACHMAN from the enquiry.

Statement File
Page Nos 115-117

Statement File
Page Nos 133-134

290. Evidence has been clearly available for some time to show that PEACHMAN and Adrian HAMPSON alias Victor NORRIS, were at the material time of MURRELL's death on an assignment with two other persons at a village called Clare, near Sudbury, Suffolk. One of the other persons referred to was PEACHMAN's daughter, Sandra.

291. It was as late as Saturday, 27th April, after speaking to Mrs PEACHMAN and Adrian HAMPSON, that Mr SMITH surprisingly learnt that no one had ever asked either of them about the movements of Barrie PEACHMAN for the 21st March. Mrs PEACHMAN has openly stated that she was previously interviewed by officers from West Mercia but no one sought to find out the movements of her late husband for that date. Both Mrs PEACHMAN and HAMPSON were able to supply the review team with documentary evidence to support their version. The other eliminating factors as relates to PEACHMAN are shown in paragraphs 220 to 223.

Document 45
Page No 158
Document 46
Page Nos 159-160

292. Considering the knowledge held by West Mercia Police concerning the connection of PEACHMAN and HAMPSON with Sizewell protesters, coupled with information from an MP who openly talks of a Police cover up, someone should have properly checked PEACHMAN through the system several months ago and eliminated him.

Document 40
Page No 142

293. One wonders whether any steps would have been taken to do this had not the anonymous caller rang 'Crimewatch UK'. As it happens, PEACHMAN was not involved but if the worst had come out of it then the close friends, associates and relatives of the deceased woman together with many politicians would have been in a position to add fuel to their speculation of a state cover-up.

Document 42
Page Nos 147-148

294. Following the examination of numerous suspects files, the review officer feels that Mr DREW may wish to take another look at the following persons and consider a recommendation that the evidence against them warrants review. This will allow further enquiries to be made in an effort to establish their movements during the material times of the murder. They can all be termed as very interesting suspects.

1. Ronald Kenneth OFFLAND (25.07.43)
No previous convictions
2. Christopher Raymond WATTON (22.10.65)
CRO 29565/82V
3. Charles Ronald BEVAN (03.02.63)
CRO 124301/77L
4. John Nicholas EVANS (10.05.45)
CRO 57130/62
5. Petrel Horst BEESLEY (17.11.48)
CRO 66206/63

295. If Mr DREW wishes to respond to the suggestion, Mr SMITH would be delighted to discuss his reasons for singling out these five suspects.

CONCLUSIONS

Photograph Nos
26 & 27

296. The murder of Hilda MURRELL at Hunkington near Shrewsbury on Wednesday, 21st March 1984, was, to the senior investigating officer, the product of a burglary at her home that had gone wrong. As far as the West Mercia Police were concerned, the enquiry was geared towards this motive and the murder hunt took the normal course whilst making huge demands on resources. Then came dramatic speculation fired mainly by the media, which was to change the whole dimension of the enquiry.

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

Document 11
Page No 50
Document 13
Page Nos 62 & 63
Document 14
Page Nos 64-67

297. Eight months after her death came the first piece of media speculation linking the murder of Hilda MURRELL with her anti nuclear views. This was publicly explored by journalist Judith COOK in a 'New Statesman' article published on the 9th November. Following this, several national newspapers then carried stories expounding on the Government Agents theory which mushroomed and grew out of all proportion.

Document 10
Page No 44

298. Some six weeks later during the early hours of the 20th December, Mr DALYELL startled members of the House of Commons when he sensationally claimed that he had received information from a proven source that Hilda MURRELL had been killed after disturbing members of the British Intelligence Service searching her Shrewsbury home for Belgrano related documents.

299. He strongly emphasised that the intruders did not intend to kill her but things went disastrously wrong which had prompted a cover up between West Mercia Police, British Intelligence and the Home Office. To continue, this latest revelation set off a bizarre round of intense speculation which seemed to fester with the passage of time. This prompted a succession of witnesses to continually produce a stream of circumstantial detail, rumour and speculation which in their own minds, warranted proper investigation by the West Mercia Police in step with the criminal enquiry.

300. The fact that West Mercia openly chose to treat some of this speculation lightly, proved to be a mistake which gave journalists and reporters a field day. To do this with any enquiry is dangerous and more so in a case which ricocheted from the norm for a murder into a politically loaded area of controversy which does not want to go away.

301. Numerous allegations of strange and contradictory comments attributed to the Police helped to develop the theory that the killer was not a thief but some agent of the State who had been disturbed searching her house for Belgrano secrets or anti nuclear work.

302. Mr SMITH feels that some reporters have made mistakes through misunderstanding the importance of some of the evidence and that these have helped fuel the so called cover up theories.

303. Some people reached a conclusion that the Police were committed to the burglary gone wrong theory and did not want to know about anything else. Comments by the media inferring a lack of police interest in the speculation have helped to fuel this situation and some of the remarks attributed to the Police have had an aggravating effect on the speculators and other persons who had an interest in Hilda MURRELL.

304. A dip check into press cuttings shows the following response to Mr DALYELL's allegation about British Intelligence officers murdering Hilda MURRELL.

Document 27
Page No 101

(a) Detective Superintendent B MAINE described Mr DALYELL's claims as 'absolute and complete rubbish - we are still working on the theory that we have worked on throughout and that is that she surprised an intruder looking for money.'

(Sunday Telegraph 23.12.84)

(b) A senior detective said 'Imagine it. The cream of British Intelligence with all methods available to them openly abduct an old woman, bundle her in a car before leaving her to die. Hardly a sophisticated operation. Bluntly it is 'a load of cobblers.'

(Daily Mail 21.12.84)

Document 51
Page No 166

(c) West Mercia Police quote 'Allegations of this nature have been fully investigated by the Force on these particular lines of enquiry which are not being pursued further at the moment. No evidence has come to light which has substantiated these allegations.'

(Guardian 21.12.84)

Document 11
Page No 50

This comment appears rather hasty considering that the MP only made his sensational claims to the House in the early hours of the previous day.

The following comment was made in response to a claim from the MP that the MURRELL case was linked with an unlawful search made in the Parliamentary office of Francis PYM.

- (d) A spokesman for West Mercia Police implied 'allegations such as those concerning Mr PYM's office were not matters for West Mercia'.

(Shropshire Star, 25.01.85)

Document 28
Page No 102

305. Mr SMITH is now in a position to independently and constructively review the criminal enquiry and the vast amount of speculation accompanying it, and give an unbiased view of the murder motive. This point has been reached after spending eight weeks examining all aspects which has necessitated travelling the country and interviewing 45 relevant witnesses and others beside.

306. Firstly, there are two beliefs when trying to establish a motive. The first is the one which is firmly held by West Mercia Police of a burglary which went wrong as against the sensational claim that Miss MURRELL was the victim of a state murder linked with either her anti nuclear activities or the Belgrano leaks.

307. The theories of a twin conspiracy with Sizewell and Belgrano connections in purely practical terms are both perfectly possible, whether they are likely or not is another matter.

308. The two most important witnesses for the state crime and Police cover up theories are Mr DALYELL and Commander GREEN who both have different proposals and views.

309. Dealing first with Mr DALYELL, all of the information or speculation that he has come up with concerning the Belgrano/British Intelligence theories have been thoroughly combed, analysed and investigated. Mr SMITH and his team concentrated on all matters concerned with her death and left other people to pursue their political motives and issues elsewhere.

310. Mr DALYELL is fired with the belief that the full story of the Belgrano issues has not all been revealed and he offers Clive PONTING as proof of how a source of seemingly unlikely information can turn out to be wholly accurate. He relies on this to support and give credibility to his source about the MURRELL murder.

Document 6
Page Nos 24-25

311. The 'New Statesman' article by Judith COOK highlighting Commander GREEN's relationship with the murdered woman, and the Sizewell theory was, without doubt, a swaying point with Mr DALYELL and Commander GREEN. One is left to wonder what the present situation would be like if the article had never been published or alternatively, if a senior officer from West Mercia Police had challenged the many inaccuracies it contained which tarnished the very fine reputation of the Force.

312. Mr DALYELL's sensational claims to the House were followed by circumstantial information and speculation, which he continually produced as evidence of a conspiracy to cover up the murder by British Intelligence Officers.

Document 12
Page No 59
Document 24
Page No 98

313. He inferred that the retiring Chief Constable of West Mercia had been provided with a lucrative Home Office job, that the three suspended detectives had been told not to properly clear the case, that the link between Detective Chief Superintendent COLE and GCHQ originally formed when dealing with the spy Geoffrey PRIME, was facilitating the cover up, intervention by FBI, Special Branch involvement

Document 25
Page 99
Document 26
Page No 100
Document 50
Page No 165

Document 53
Page No 168

and the use of hypnosis which DALYELL claimed was a very unusual occurrence, hinting that it was used to make witnesses forget not remember.

Document 28
Page No 102
Document 30
Page No 104
Document 32
Page 108
Documents 39 & 40
Page Nos 140-142

314. In support of these he offered the rummaging of Francis PYM's Parliamentary Office, the burglaries at the home of publisher, Cecil WOOLF and Commander HURST and the Barrie PEACHMAN saga, all of which have been thoroughly reviewed.

Document 54
Page Nos 169-178

315. Mr Alf FARAGHER, Forensic Scientist, and Mr SMITH have together fully examined Mr DALYELL's claim that the Forensic Science services were also involved in the cover up with the Police and British Intelligence.

Document 54
Page Nos 171-173

316. The review scientist thoroughly examined all of the forensic findings, including the use and assistance of scientific and professional resources and established that they had been efficiently and professionally completed. This supported the claims of Dr ACLAND against speculation that he had been influenced by members of secret service organisations to participate in the cover up. Mr FARAGHER considers that these areas have been explored to the full and found nothing to suggest that any evidence was being misconstrued or ignored.

Document 54
Page Nos 173-175
Document 55
Page No 179

Document 54
Page No 178

317. Mr DALYELL agrees that on this subject, he has become a receptacle for information, speculation and rumour. As far as his informant is concerned the MP is the only person who can assess his credibility against the information given. His own credibility is at stake and one would think that with this in mind, he would not have gambled his reputation without placing a vast amount of faith in the informant. If Mr DALYELL is ever proved to be wrong then surely he would be discredited.

318. Every effort has been made by Mr SMITH to persuade Mr DALYELL to encourage his source to come forward as this is the only way that the information and speculation can be fully and independently tested. The MP agrees with this but no communication has been forthcoming from his source.

319. A careful assessment of the information supplied by Mr DALYELL, both written and oral, has been closely and independently reviewed and evaluated. It fails to provide any supporting evidence to his claim that there is a link between the death of Hilda MURRELL and British Intelligence, or any other agency. The same conclusion is applied to his suggestion that the West Mercia Police, Forensic Science Services and the Security Services are party to a cover up.

320. The information he has supplied throughout consists mainly of a collection of speculative articles, letters or even remarks from various sources, none of which provides any real evidence and can be best described as rumour and speculation.

321. As regards Commander GREEN, he believes that his aunt's death was directly connected with her anti nuclear views. He was no doubt encouraged in this belief by the 'New Statesman' article and the last telephone call his aunt made to Mr MORGAN-GRENVILLE when she allegedly and anxiously said, 'If they don't get me first I want the world to know that one old woman has seen through their lies.'

322. He has allowed his suspicions to be aroused by what he terms as strange and contradictory statements issued by the Police which, in the eyes of many people, have helped to develop the theory that the killer was not a burglar in the furtherance of theft but some agent of the state who had been disturbed whilst searching her house for either Belgrano leaks or anti nuclear work.

Document 6
Page Nos 24 & 25

Statement File
Page No 108

323. His suspicions of a Police and Security Services cover up were festered by the malfunctioning telephones at his aunt's chalet at Llanymynech and her home address in Shrewsbury. The chalet fire at Llanymynech did not help. These were supported by Commander GREEN's strong suspicions that his home telephone in Dorset had been bugged.

324. In an attempt to evaluate the theory that she was killed because of anti nuclear views or by agents disturbed trying to find her Sizewell papers, it is essential to weigh her importance as an enemy to the nuclear power industry.

325. It is known that she had written to the Secretariat of the Sizewell enquiry on several occasions, the first being on the 12th August 1983, asking each time for documents. She was one of thousands of people who wrote seeking information. It was not known until 28th January 1984, that she was a principal objector to the project and was preparing to give evidence at the enquiry.

326. To put this in perspective, she was one of approximately 5000 principal objectors and the review team throughout their prolonged enquiries have found no reason whatsoever which would single Hilda MURRELL out for attack. In support of this, when her report was independently assessed after her death, it was found to be well written but did not contain any new startling revelations or threats towards pro nuclear organisations or supporters.

327. As regards her Sizewell report, it must not be forgotten that two copies of it were openly available in her house on the breakfast room table, which the offender(s) chose not to steal.

Document 38
Page No 138

Document 35
Page Nos 112-135

Document 35
Page Nos 112-135

328. During the first three months of this year, some aspects of the media chose to claim that the final draft had been stolen and this rumour like many others got completely out of hand. It was finally dispelled when the document was physically produced on the 'Crimewatch UK' programme screened on the 14th March. This killed off another round of speculation.

329. Lines of enquiry pursued by the review team have embraced all of the organisations to which Miss MURRELL belonged or expressed an interest in. This included her involvement in conservationist matters directly involving nuclear waste but she was not a power in any of them.

330. In conclusion, thorough enquiries by the review team over a period of two months have failed to reveal one shred of evidence to support Commander GREEN's allegation that British Intelligence or any other Government agencies were involved in the murder. Additionally, no evidence was uncovered to support his fears of a Police cover up.

331. In favour of these conclusions, one cannot help but consider the extensive enquiry of considerable proportion that has been undertaken by West Mercia Police and other supporting agencies, during the prolonged investigation, which has so far, failed to find the killer of Hilda MURRELL.

332. Additionally, it would have to be acceptable that the West Mercia Police and the Intelligence Services or Agents were involved in a society where no one is accountable and violence is privately tolerated by murderers from the Government. It would also have to be feasible that the 1,923 members of the West Mercia Police Force were equally involved in any conspiracy.

333. It is pertinent to mention that the review officer made his assessment after personally interviewing members in the highest echelons of the British Cabinet, Security Services, Naval Intelligence, British Telecom and the Post Office.

334. After considering the facts and speculative theories and examining all of the available evidence, both Mr SMITH and Detective Superintendent HALL support the opinion of Detective Chief Superintendent COLE that the murder was a by-product of a burglary which went wrong. Their supporting reasons for doing so are clearly set out in this report. However, this is only an opinion which in no way should dampen the appetite to follow up speculation.



Assistant Chief Constable